

ArtWorks Scotland: Evaluation Report

Final Draft: October 2014

Prepared by Hilary Nicoll: Project Manager, ArtWorks Scotland



Contents	Page
1. Acknowledgements	2
2. Background and Introduction	3
3. Executive Summary and Recommendations	4
4. The Need For ArtWorks Scotland	13
5. The ArtWorks Scotland Approach	14
5.1 Initial Phase: Peer to Peer Networks, Commissioned Research, AWS Research	14
5.2 Intermediate Stage	19
5.3 Action Plan	19
5.4 Partnerships	20
5.5 Evaluation Framework	20
6. The Pilots	22
7. Other Activity	29
8. Analysis Against Outcomes and Indicators	33
9. Embedding and Sustainability	58
10. Other Learning	61
11. Recommendations	63
12. Appendices:	64
Appendix 1: Budget	
Appendix 2: Quantitative tables	
Appendix 3: Organisations attending Scottish Mentoring Network	
Appendix 4: List of events and conferences	

1. Acknowledgements

ArtWorks: Developing Practice in Participatory Settings is a special initiative from the Paul Hamlyn Foundation, which supports the continuing professional development of artists working in participatory settings.

ArtWorks is a workforce scheme that seeks to meet the needs of artists at different stages in their careers - from the aspiring young artist embarking on training, to experienced practitioners who wish to progress their output. It is seeking to build on good practice to enhance the existing development infrastructure. ArtWorks Scotland is led and match funded by Creative Scotland.

ArtWorks: Developing Practice in Participatory Settings is a Paul Hamlyn Foundation Special Initiative with funding and support from the Arts and Humanities Research Council, Creativity Culture & Education (supported by Arts Council England) and the Cultural Leadership Programme.

This report was prepared by Hilary Nicoll, Freelance Project Manager, ArtWorks Scotland, with support from Graeme Reekie, Evaluation Support Scotland, and Chrissie Ruckley, Development Officer, Creative Scotland and ArtWorks Scotland Project Lead.

Project manager / main author: Hilary Nicoll

Email: hilarynicoll@hotmail.com

2. Background and Introduction

ArtWorks: Developing Practice in Participatory Settings aimed to facilitate a step change in the way that participatory work is viewed by fostering greater understanding of what is required to successfully deliver a participatory arts project. This aim is built upon the premise that the availability and supply of training and support to artists will generate higher quality, better respected and valued arts-led experiences for a variety of audiences and clients.

The key objectives of the initiative were:

- To develop, pilot and embed training and continuous professional development methods for artists working in participatory settings at all stages in their careers;
- To develop a better understanding of what constitutes quality in participatory work through sharing good practice across art forms and demonstrating positive outcomes; and
- To gather, document and disseminate compelling evidence of positive impact.

ArtWorks Scotland is one of 5 ArtWorks pathfinder projects across the UK that include ArtWorks Cymru, ArtWorks London, ArtWorks Navigator and ArtWorks North East. It is led by Creative Scotland (CS) who provided match funding for the project of £300,000 over 3 1/2 years.

AWS was supported by an active 'umbrella group' of engage Scotland, Scottish Book Trust, YDance, Scottish Dance Theatre, Federation of Scottish Theatre, Glasgow Film Theatre (representing Young Cinema Audiences Scotland), and the Scottish Traditional Music Forum. An additional research advisory group, made up of Umbrella Group members and other stakeholders, was formed to support the initial research phase of the project.

This report aims to capture the impact of ArtWorks Scotland. Sections 3 and 4 describe the need for ArtWorks Scotland and the approach adopted to develop and deliver the project. Sections 5 to 7 outline early stage research, action planning and detail the pilot projects. In section 8 there is an in-depth analysis of the pilot projects against the AWS evaluation framework. Sections 9 to 11 focus on future activity and additional learning, and concludes with the project recommendations.

3. Executive Summary and Recommendations

The need for ArtWorks Scotland was established through the review of funding programmes and other research by Scottish Arts Council, as well as work undertaken by Paul Hamlyn Foundation that built up a picture of a burgeoning but disconnected and largely informal area of creative practice that would benefit from further research and strategic intervention.

Table 1. Reports demonstrating need for ArtWorks initiative

Report	Content
Evaluation of Partners Artists Residencies, Research and Evaluation Summary Report, EKOS, March 2009	Recommends more cross-project sharing of experience and networking for artists working in a range of settings
Evaluation of the Arts Across the Curriculum Programme report, Quality in Education Centre, University of Strathclyde, March 2008	Explores models of good practice for artists and teachers working together, as well as elements of CPD
Mapping of Training Opportunities for 'Teaching Artists' in Scotland, BOP Consulting, May 2010	Makes recommendations around leadership, information and communication, support and accreditation and Quality Assurance
Artists Working in Participatory Settings, Research Report, Paul Hamlyn Foundation (Internal Document) Susanne Burns , February 2009	Recommends interventions by the Paul Hamlyn Foundation should be incremental and should seek to create developmental pathways from an initial proactive position.

In 2010 Paul Hamlyn Foundation set up the ArtWorks special initiative, to which Creative Scotland made a successful bid for support for ArtWorks Scotland (AWS); a three and a half year action research project framed around three lines of enquiry:

- Are we developing increased connectivity and joined up thinking at all levels in the sector?
- What are the skills, knowledge and qualities that artists need to work in participatory settings and how best can we support artists to develop these?
- What does quality look like and how best can we enhance the quality of this work in Scotland?

Table 2. ArtWorks Scotland Timeline

	Stage	Timeframe	Activity
1	Initial	Dec 2011- Oct 2012	Research and data gathering, including setting up the Peer to Peer Networks
2	Intermediate	Nov 2012 - March 2013	Analysis and action planning, within which an evaluation framework was developed
3	Piloting	March 2014- June 2014	17 Projects in partnership with wide range of institutions and organisations
4	Analysis and Reporting	July-Sept 2014	Conclusions, recommendations, next steps

Initial research commissioned by AWS from Consilium in 2011 provided clear evidence of the fragmented nature of existing training and continuing professional development (CPD) initiatives for artists working in participatory settings in Scotland, and the need for the proactive development of a community of practice.

The research indicated that the majority of artists (95% in Consilium survey) believed that more courses and other CPD opportunities specialising in arts in participatory settings should be available, that they were willing to pay for good quality training, but that accreditation was not a priority ¹.

Artists preferred learning methods had an experiential focus, with mentoring and observation of experienced practitioners considered most effective. The research recommended developing a range of professional development approaches, rather than 'one size fits all', to provide for artists at all career stages.

At the outset, AWS supported a group of 5 Peer to Peer Artists Networks to provide direct links to creative practitioners over the duration of the project. These groups acted as a research and consultation base for the project, while being supported to develop CPD opportunities amongst and for themselves.

Further research by AWS Researcher Dr Fiona Dean in 2012 focussed on the Peer to Peer Networks, exploring artists' career paths and preferred roles when working in participatory settings. It also identified 15 quality factors to support this work. Follow-up research in 2013 tested these quality factors with artists' 'partners'; employers, commissioners or managers.

¹ Skillset Research and Gap Analysis for Artists Working in Participatory Settings, 2012, Consilium

Table 3: AWS Research Outputs

Date	Report Title	Author
March 2012	Skillset Research and Gap Analysis for Artists Working in Participatory Settings: Phase 1 Report	Consilium Research and Consultancy
October 2012	Skillset Research and Gap Analysis for Artists Working in Participatory Settings: Phase 2 Report	Consilium Research and Consultancy
October 2012	Learning from ArtWorks Scotland Peer to Peer Networks	Dr Fiona Dean
November 2013	Quality Perspectives, Artists and Partners: Research Background and Key Observations	Dr Fiona Dean
February 2014	Student Placements in Prison Learning Centres: Research Report	Dr Fiona Dean
March 2014	Revisiting Learning from the Peer to Peer Networks	Dr Fiona Dean
July 2014	Recommendations for a Quality Guidance resource for artists and learning providers	Gillian Steel

Following analysis of the 2012 research, ArtWorks Scotland developed an eight point Action Plan and an Evaluation Framework of four outcomes based on the original lines of enquiry, against which evidence of progress, learning and impact could be mapped.

Summary Action Plan:

- Develop models of organisation-based mentoring and sectoral knowledge exchange
- Disseminate research and learning from the ArtWorks Scotland project to HE/ FE and other partners
- Embed learning from ArtWorks Scotland into Creative Scotland funding programmes
- Develop and publish a quality framework/ guidance for factors which support quality
- Develop coherent online information and connectivity
- Pilot a range of approaches to raising the profile of work in participatory settings in undergraduate courses and develop good practice guidance for placements
- Support and develop the peer to peer artists networks for the life of the project
- Develop a series of seminars and annual events

Evaluation Framework Outcomes:

1. Increased connectivity and joined up thinking at all levels in the sector
2. Better understanding of the skills, knowledge and qualities that artists need to work in participatory settings – and how to support these
3. Better understanding of factors which support quality in arts in participatory settings and how to develop this
4. A more professional and confident sector whose work and value is perceived as important and whose voice is stronger

The outcomes are intended to underpin specific development areas, but it is also important to understand that each is highly interconnected. Increased connectivity and joined up thinking happens in many ways, including, for example, through skills development, where training and sharing events create excellent opportunities for attendees to connect across the sector. Similarly continuing professional development models, such as mentoring and placements within the sector positively influence aspects of quality, confidence and professionalism.

In January 2013 the AWS action plan was published (summarised on page 6 above) and a partnership approach to piloting and evaluating a range of activities across Scotland was developed.

AWS worked with leading cultural organisations, education institutions and national arts companies across Scotland to develop the approach (see table 4 below), allowing organisations to create bespoke solutions to the lines of enquiry posed by AWS. In addition, AWS worked to forge links with practitioners across all artforms and career stages nationally and internationally.

Table 4. Pilot Projects

HE/FE Pilot Projects	Mentoring Pilots	Creative Learning Network Knowledge Exchange Pilots
Glasgow School of Art Dept of Sculpture and Environmental Art/New College Lanarkshire (GSA/NCL)	Dancehouse	Aberdeen City Council
Gray's School of Art	GMAC (Glasgow Media Access Centre)	Inverclyde Council

HE/FE Pilot Projects	Mentoring Pilots	Creative Learning Network Knowledge Exchange Pilots
Edinburgh College	SEE (Screen Education Edinburgh)	Angus Council
Moray House/Edinburgh College of Art	TMF (Traditional Music Forum)	City of Edinburgh Council
Shetland College/University of Highlands and Islands	Luminate	Forth Valley Council
Royal Conservatoire of Scotland (RCS) : 2 Pilots		
Number of Participants : 672	Number of Participants : 39	Number of Participants : 642

The pilot projects provided self-evaluation reports which are analysed in detail in [Section 8](#) of this report, with a summary of the impact of these projects, as well as other AWS activities against the AWS outcomes below.

As well as the overall impact against these outcomes, it is important to recognise the myriad of smaller 'wins' that the project has made, providing new connections, inspiration, confidence and training for individual practitioners, institutions and organisations across Scotland.

Other aspects that have been effective, such as the successful annual conferences, and have potential to be effective, such as plans for further online developments and continued growth of the academic network cannot continue without additional resources being committed beyond December 2014.

Summary of Impact against Outcomes

AWS has successfully achieved increased connectivity and joined up thinking at all levels in the sector, with the most significant impacts being felt within CS, for partners, and for individuals directly involved in the project and its pilots; the closer individuals have been to the activities, the more they have benefitted.

A community of practice is evolving. Consilium found in 2012 that 'Just under one quarter of artists (23%) working in participatory settings stated that they feel part of a connected community of practice with 42%

stating they sometimes do. Just under one third do not feel part of a community of practice'.²

79% of respondents to the AWS 2011 conference survey felt there was *not* a community of practice amongst artists working in participatory settings in Scotland. Subsequent conference surveys showed a positive impact, with between 61% and 80% reporting an increased community of practice at subsequent conferences in 2012 and 13. Further resources would be needed to continue to develop this impact more widely.

AWS has facilitated a better understanding of the skills, knowledge and qualities that artists need to work in participatory settings.

On completion, all of the pilot projects responding reported a better understanding of the skills, knowledge and qualities that artists need to work in participatory settings, and how to support this. The majority (7/10) of pilot projects emphatically felt that they have a better understanding of the skills needed to work in participatory settings and how to support artists to develop these. Every pilot project has also reported back in detail on the learning from their individual projects (see [Section 8: Analysis against Outcomes and Indicators](#)).

Individual testimonies from Peer to Peer Network members confirm the high value placed on their involvement in the networks, the confidence that this has built, and in particular the way in which networks successfully acted as a 'bridge' between graduation and professional practice.

There are good indications that further impact will be achieved more fully as evaluation and learning materials are produced and disseminated in the latter stages of the project.

A new module and an accredited short course have resulted from the HE/FE pilot projects and two placement programmes will continue. A placement good practice guidance [website](#) has been created for students, host organisations and HE and FE.

**Resource: placement
good practice guidance**

<http://artworks.rcs.ac.uk/>

² Skillset Research and Gap Analysis for Artists Working in Participatory Settings, 2012, Consilium

Through ArtWorks Scotland students, trainees/mentees and mentors have reached a much more positive understanding of their existing strengths in terms of skills, knowledge and qualities. For most this has resulted in an enhanced sense of confidence about their abilities and status.

AWS has made significant inroads to enabling a better understanding of factors which support quality in arts in participatory settings and how to develop this.

A key impact is the deeper connection across CS, in particular regarding the Creative Learning and Young People connector theme. This is an extremely positive unintended outcome for AWS, which builds on plans to embed AWS learning around quality within CS, and offers a deeper route into programmes beyond simply developing guidance, as per original plans.

In summary a more strategic approach to practice development, connectivity and quality has been reached, joining up thinking across programmes responsible for total funding of £38 Million over 3 years.

The AWS events and pilot projects have successfully impacted on developing a more professional and confident sector. 71% of those attending the AWS 2012 conference reported feeling more confident about working in participatory settings. Of the 5 HE/FE Pilots that reported back, all state that the value of arts in participatory settings is perceived to have increased within their institution.

The AWS project continues to make progress across a very wide network of institutions and their staff and students, increasing the perceived value of arts in participatory settings and strengthening its voice.

Other Learning

- We know the high value of cross artform and intra-career stage exchange and learning for all artists. Gaining a better understanding of skills can increase confidence, though there is a lack of consistent understanding of 'skills' terminology in the arts and cultural sector.
- Supporting passionate, energetic professionals with a vision for development of the sector through a more reciprocal relationship than the orthodox funder/recipient model has contributed significantly to the success of the pilot projects.
- There is a recognised need for an ongoing co-ordinating presence to lead a planned programme beyond ArtWorks phase 1. This is important when considering the consistency with which artists report back on the limited time and energy they can commit to

managing and initiating networking and other learning events. AWS impacts are unlikely to continue to be felt without further leadership and resources being committed.

Legacy

All the HE/FE pilot projects report that they will continue work towards embedding their learning into their institutions. This means continuing with new courses and learning approaches, and the new partnerships that will continue to provide placements.

The mentoring pilot projects are better able to support both artists and the groups they work with. The pilots have increased capacity, improving confidence and creating a new level of ambition to continue to develop and embed this work.

The Peer to Peer Networks will continue to meet and plan activities, with one now a constituted charity with a national remit, and others seeking funds for further development.

A significant resource of online material has been produced over the course of the AWS project, with 43 films of keynote speeches, good practice case studies and other related material now available to view. Podcasts, infographics and all the AWS research reports are also available on the ArtWorks Scotland webpages on the Creative Scotland site, and have been shared through the AWS LinkedIn and Twitter networks, both now in excess of 320 members.

The new Placements website is live and will be maintained by the Royal Conservatoire, enshrining the AWS principle of sustainability within the sector where possible. Guidance on mentoring for the cultural sector, developed by Scottish Mentoring Network will soon be available; another example of how outputs can be embedded in the sector. Further online guidance for artists and learning practitioners working within education settings will be produced in partnership with Education Scotland.

New national networks for mentoring in the cultural sector, and for academics interested in arts in participatory settings now exist.

The key legacy for AWS is the impact on all those working within the field, across artforms and career stages, whether in creative practice or employing and commissioning artists, who are now networked and feel part of a growing community of practice and with that, a sense of increased confidence and recognition of the value of their work.

Resource: Artworks Scotland videos

<http://vimeo.com/channels/artworksscotland>

Online resources

<http://www.creativescotland.com/what-we-do/major-projects/creative-learning-and-young-people/artworks-scotland/>

Recommendations:

1. Continue to support the development of the community of practice with further annual conferences, online and face-to-face events
2. Develop social media presence, keeping in mind the value of cross artform exchange, reflective practice and networking, through Twitter events and development of ArtWorksConnect plans
3. Continue to work across CS, embedding learning and sharing practice, including inputting to staff training and guidance and working across the Creative Learning team
4. Review and continue to support the national academic network
5. Continue to work with the Scottish Mentoring Network to hold events and facilitate the thematic network for culture
6. Develop guidance for CS around CPD for work in participatory settings and/or create links to guidance developed by other UK ArtWorks partners in order to encourage organisations to embed high quality CPD for artists into project plans
7. Continue to distribute existing quality factors research through infographics available as leaflets or online
8. Develop research into quality guidance for CS with input from the sector, including period for testing
9. Review the '*Quality Guidance Resource for Artists and Learning Providers*' report with a view to actioning recommendations.
10. Taking on board the principle of incremental 'small wins' across large networks, find ways to continue to work with pilot project partners to support further dissemination of their learning
11. Recognise the challenges to the continued development of confidence and professionalism that the lack of time and resources across the sector bring, and commit to continued provision of leadership and resources to build on impacts to date.
12. Continue to work effectively across the UK with legacy activity from all pathfinders

4. The need for ArtWorks Scotland

Creative Scotland recognised the need for the ArtWorks initiative following evidence from the evaluation of large scale funding programmes, such as Arts Across the Curriculum and Partners, that professional development for artists working in participatory settings should be considered a priority.

The 2010 Mapping of Training Opportunities for 'Teaching Artists' in Scotland showed that over 70% of artists who took part in the research said they were gaining their skills for working in participatory settings 'on the job', highlighting the informal and ad hoc nature of the participatory arts sector.

This initial research exposed the need for further examination to develop a more coherent national picture of the sector from the perspective of all stakeholders involved in developing the work.

These issues had been recognised across the UK by PHF, who had commissioned an internal research report in 2009 (see table 1 above) and set up the ArtWorks Special Initiative in response. Creative Scotland successfully secured support for ArtWorks Scotland in 2011, with a PHF grant of £300,000 matched by £300,000 from Creative Scotland.

A range of partners provided advisory input to the development of the proposal to PHF, including the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland, Glasgow School of Art, Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Education (HMIE), the Scottish Book Trust, and the National Theatre of Scotland.

AWS set up in April 2011, led by a member of Creative Scotland staff, and managed by a freelance Project Manager. It was advised by an 'umbrella group' of engage Scotland, Scottish Book Trust, YDance, Scottish Dance Theatre, Federation of Scottish Theatre, Glasgow Film Theatre (representing Young Cinema Audiences Scotland), and the Scottish Traditional Music Forum.

The initial research in 2011/12 made clear the fragmented nature of existing training and continuing professional development (CPD) initiatives for artists working in participatory settings in Scotland, and the need for a community of practice. It indicated that the overwhelming majority of artists believed that more courses and other CPD opportunities specialising in arts in participatory settings should be available, but that accreditation was not a priority for them. Artists preferred learning methods had an experiential focus, with mentoring and observation of experienced practitioners considered most effective.

The research recommended consideration of a range of development approaches, rather than a single approach, to provide for artists at all career stages. This recommendation was subsequently adopted by AWS.

5. The ArtWorks Scotland Approach

ArtWorks Scotland adopted an action research methodology, across four key stages:

1. Initial phase: research and data gathering, including setting up the Peer to Peer Networks: December 2011-October 2012
2. Intermediate stage: analysis and action planning, within which an evaluation framework was developed. Nov 2012 - March 2013
3. Piloting phase. March 2013- June 2014
4. Analysis and reporting phase. July -Sept 2014

Across these stages further research was carried out, events and conferences took place, and online presence was developed. Three lines of enquiry emerged to underpin the project, and became the outcomes of the evaluation framework:

- Are we developing increased connectivity and joined up thinking at all levels in the sector?
- What are the skills, knowledge and qualities that artists need to work in participatory settings and how best can we support artists to develop these?
- What does quality look like and how best can we enhance the quality of this work in Scotland?

A fourth was introduced after being highlighted during the research stage, and aligns with ArtWorks UK original outcomes:

- Are we developing a more professional and confident sector whose work and value is perceived as important and whose voice is stronger?

The four phases are discussed in more detail below

5.1 Initial Phase

The first priorities for AWS after recruiting the project team were threefold.

1. To support a cohort of artists' networks that could develop peer to peer approaches to investigating the lines of inquiry and form a research base for AWS
2. To commission research to map existing training opportunities, undertake a gaps analysis of training provision, and provide information to better understand the skillset for working in participatory settings
3. To undertake research into artists' career paths, preferred roles and a consultation on quality

Peer to Peer Networks (PPNs)

The initial stage of AWS began with a call for applications from artist-led groups working in participatory settings to apply for support to develop their own explorations of the AWS lines of inquiry. These groups would take a parallel journey alongside AWS over three years, providing a consistent connection with active practitioners. They would act as a research and consultation base for the project, while developing events and professional development opportunities for themselves and their peers, and continuing to grow their networks.

Two key contacts from each network undertook training in peer learning techniques provided by the Social Enterprise Academy, to help build the capacity of each network to support its members continuing professional development.

AWS aimed to have a good representation across artform and geography within the groups, and initially worked with the following 4 networks:

SPAN (Scottish Prison Artists Network) - A cross artform group of practitioners with an interest in developing work in prison settings, initially based in Glasgow but now with a broader national reach. Since becoming an AWS PPN, Scottish Prison Artists Network have constituted as an Scottish Charitable Incorporated Organisation and secured funding and staff. SPAN are part of the Arts and Justice advisory group, which was formed to provide expertise and guidance for the three year [Arts and Criminal Justice Action Plan](#). Their website can be found [here](#). SPAN continue to grow and develop beyond AWS phase 1 and have plans to seek additional funding and establish themselves further as an organisation beyond 2014.

Resources:

Arts and Criminal Justice Action Plan

<http://creativescotland.org.uk/explore/projects/arts-criminal-justice>

NEPAN Blog

<http://nepan.wordpress.com/about-nepan/>

PATTER website

http://www.patternetwork.co.uk/?page_id=5

NEPAN(North East Participatory Arts Network) - A group of primarily visual artists and photographers based in and around Aberdeen, working in community and education settings. Over the course of the project the majority of members secured permanent jobs, with several leaving the region, and becoming less active as arts practitioners, highlighting the choices that artists may make as they progress in their careers. Through NEPAN, AWS has strengthened links with the Creative learning team at Aberdeen City Council. The NEPAN blog can be found [here](#).

PATTER - A network of theatre practitioners and visual artists with an interest in developing performance for early years. Patter expanded rapidly and has a large membership with a high proportion of students and emerging artists, due in part to connections with the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland. It meets in both Edinburgh and Glasgow and 'will continue to provide a vital space for artists to meet, discuss their work and develop away from commissioning partners and funding bodies'.

Their website can be found [here](#). Patter continue to meet and hold events and workshops beyond AWS phase 1.

TRIGGER - A visual artists and makers from the Dundee area with an interest in working in schools, and strong connections to the Angus Artists in Schools scheme managed by Angus Council, and to Duncan of Jordanstone College of Art and Design. This is a smaller group that took the decision early on not to expand, but to develop a deeper peer to peer discussion amongst existing members. TRIGGER have a facebook group.

Aware that some artforms were not represented, AWS solicited further applications, working closely with a group of dance artists from across Scotland, in recognition of the need for the dance sector to be better heard within the project. The application was not completed, as individuals involved were too concerned about time and energy required to manage a network alongside their job commitments.

EYMF (Edinburgh Youth Music Forum) joined AWS as a PPN in 2012. As an existing group of musicians working with young people in Edinburgh, the network was well established, but were looking for opportunities to develop further structured peer learning events, which AWS was able to support.

The PPNs are the subject of 2 research reports by AWS Researcher Dr. Fiona Dean; *Learning from ArtWorks Scotland Peer to Peer Networks* of October 2012 and *Revisiting Learning from the Peer to Peer Networks* of March 2014.

As well as making a significant contribution to this and other AWS research the PPNs took part in 2 residential weekends during 2012 and 2014. These included structured learning sessions led by network members and external facilitators allowing a deeper level of professional development and skills sharing across artforms, with the additional benefit of evolving a larger network across all of the PPNs.

The PPNs reported back extensively about their experience, with the following quotes from individual members illustrating their feedback in relation to the AWS outcomes:

About connectivity:

"The funding and connection with ArtWorks has been important - we feel valued as a network with a collective voice in the sector within the context of AWS – the idea of art in participatory settings becoming a sector is important, so is having a strong voice that this is coming up from us."

"Practitioner connections are core - that's the core purpose of our network, it's where the energy is, where it works best is where that happens."

"We've all become much more networked through this process and it's affected how we handle our job situations now; it feels like it's more up to us how the sessions shape and progress now."

About the level of impact ArtWorks Scotland has had on the networks' development:

"We'd say maybe 25% of our work has been impacted by AWS - it sounds low but it's a lot - we existed already and its impacted what we can do - it's impacted on active work; the residential never would have happened without this support and that's allowed new things to happen."

"It's impacted 100% - without that structure, leading it, taking it on, pushing through, I don't think these things would have happened or if they had it wouldn't have been easy for us to capture and say 'these things happened'; going along to monthly meetings, seeing and capturing evidence of what is happening - it becomes tangible - so it might have happened, but maybe only informally, so this has had effect."

"Things would have happened for us, but it gave us a structure and focus - we existed loosely before; we knew each other and knew we wanted to do something but AWS came along and that gave us the focus."

"It wouldn't have happened without AWS - 95% catalyst - steeled us into doing it. Not just financial: support role was vital to us continuing [...] because it was linked to AWS and Creative Scotland, people perceived the network to have a sense of quality."

About confidence:

"We have a greater understanding of what it is that we do and the conditions and environment we are doing it in and the people we are working with and for; it's a greater understanding which feels like a huge gain."

"My initial reaction was 'why am I being invited into this'; just out of art school, 'what do I know', but I realised through this

that I did have skills; a reflective process and I'm using it in my work the whole time - it affects the quality of what you do, the evaluation process is in there for you, it's making me question a whole range of things in my work situation."

"Going to the PPN from being a student, as an equal, has given me greater agency as an artist."

Commissioned Research: Mapping, Skillset and Gaps Analysis

To achieve a greater understanding of the participatory arts sector and its needs, AWS commissioned Consilium Research and Consultancy in December 2011 to deliver a two-phase piece of research, mapping existing training provision across Scotland within HE, FE and cultural organisations, and undertaking skillset research and a gaps analysis.

The phase 1 report, *Skillset Research and Gap Analysis for Artists Working in Participatory Settings*, published in March 2012, was supported by an Advisory group and includes an overview of training for artists in participatory settings gathered through desk research, and initial conclusions from stakeholder consultations.

Phase 2 of the same was published in October 2012, and concludes with 13 recommendations that draw on the phase 1 research, as well as a survey of over 200 artists, 56 telephone consultations, and three cross-sectoral focus groups covering artists working in prisons, schools and with older people.

The recommendations can broadly be summarised as identifying need for:

- Supporting initial training
- Supporting continuing professional development
- Creating a more professional and confident sector
- Commissioner validation and quality assurance ³

AWS Research: Artists career paths, roles and quality factors

AWS appointed a researcher in December 2011, with an initial brief to focus on the PPNs to develop a deeper understanding of artists' training and career paths, preferred roles when working in participatory settings, and an exploration of factors that artists considered best support quality.

The research report⁴ identifies fifteen quality factors and includes an analysis of the importance that artists attached to them compared with

³ Skillset Research and Gap Analysis for Artists Working in Participatory Settings: Phase 2 Report p5/6, Consilium 2012

⁴ Learning from ArtWorks Scotland Peer to Peer Networks, Dr Fiona Dean, 2012

the frequency with which they are perceived to happen in practice. These findings were summarised in an infographic leaflet produced and distributed by AWS in 2012.

5.2. Intermediate Stage:

Drawing on the research recommendations, AWS developed an Action Plan and an Evaluation Framework within which to take the project forward. Working with Evaluation Support Scotland, a Logic Model was used to ensure plans were consistent with the need identified in the research, and to test any assumptions.

The process of review and analysis of research material confirmed the key issues:

- There was a lack of connectivity within the sector and within key institutions and organisations
- The training offer from HE/FE and cultural organisations is largely supply rather than demand led
- There was a lack of common understanding of what constitutes quality between the cultural sector, partners and employers
- There was a lack of common understanding of the skills, knowledge and qualities needed to work in these settings and much existing provision is not in the format artists prefer
- Artists tend to develop skills for working in participatory settings 'on the job' rather than being actively supported to develop skills through training and work
- The work tends to have a low profile and value across all sectors

These key findings informed the programme of pilot project activity contained within the Action Plan.

5.3 The Action Plan

This was published in January 2013 and identifies 8 key areas of activity:

- Develop Models of organisation based mentoring and sectoral knowledge exchange
- Disseminate research and learning from the ArtWorks Scotland project to HE/ FE and other partners
- Embed learning from ArtWorks Scotland into Creative Scotland funding programmes
- Develop and publish a quality framework/ guidance for factors which support quality
- Develop coherent online information and connectivity

- Pilot a range of approaches to raising the profile of work in participatory settings in undergraduate courses and develop good practice guidance for placements
- Support and develop the peer to peer artists networks for the life of the project
- Develop a series of seminars and annual events

5.4 Partnerships

AWS recognised that a 'top down' funding body approach would be the wrong way to take the project forward. It was important for AWS to ensure that it was understood as being partially independent of Creative Scotland, and as responsive, flexible and supportive to sector needs.

To take forward the complex range of pilot projects proposed it was important to develop strong and trusting partnerships with organisations and institutions in the sector, and to create an environment in which change, challenge, success and failure could come together to create quality learning for all sides.

AWS worked to encourage solutions from within the sector, rather than prescribe a centralised approach. This created a model within which key individuals with expertise, energy and passion could be supported to devise and test solutions within their institutions, building capacity and developing confidence and learning along the way.

Sustainability was important for AWS. Project leads were asked to consider from the outset how their activity might continue to establish and thrive beyond the initial funding period.

Between January and June 2013, AWS put in place support for 17 pilot projects in Higher and Further Education, arts organisations and local authority-based Creative Learning Networks, as well as continuing to support the 5 PPNs. It had also created roles that would work across groups of the pilots, to document and draw together learning, so that the outcomes could be shared and guidance resources created.

5.5 The Evaluation Framework

The evaluation framework was developed before the piloting phase was initiated and has provided a backbone for the project. Developed with support from Evaluation Support Scotland it has been used to help AWS be clear about outcomes and indicators in order to provide evidence to support findings.

The pilot projects were asked to use the framework to structure their thinking as they developed proposals. The approach taken encouraged each organisation to identify the difference they wanted to make, and how they would know if it had been achieved. Training was provided at

the outset, to support the projects to translate this thinking into a plan that could sit within the overall AWS evaluation framework. Follow-up sessions provided at a mid-point in each project helped with reflection and allowed individual project members to share learning.

Reports from the pilots suggest that the evaluation training and the structured reflective time were very valuable, and created the added benefit of supporting project leaders to connect and share through the informal networks created on the training days.

'One of the most useful parts of the programme has been the evaluation courses. I have used and developed these approaches within more than one area of my teaching' HE Pilot Project Lead

'I personally enjoyed the Evaluation Workshop - it was great hearing how everyone else had engaged with the programme and utilised it to their particular needs. It was interesting to know that although our industry is quite different from those round the table we all had similar issues when dealing with 'professionals' working in a participatory settings.' Mentoring Pilot Project Lead

The framework is structured around four outcomes:

1. Increased connectivity and joined up thinking at all levels in the sector
2. Better understanding of the skills, knowledge and qualities that artists need to work in participatory settings – and how to support these
3. Better understanding of factors which support quality in arts in participatory settings and how to develop this
4. A more professional and confident sector whose work and value is perceived as important and whose voice is stronger

These are evidenced by a range of indicators, which help demonstrate the extent to which outcomes have been achieved, and what has been learned along the way. Indicators are listed after each outcome in Section 8, which provides a detailed analysis of the whole project.

6. The Pilots

The first of the 17 pilot projects began in early 2013, with the majority taking place within the academic year 2013-14. A range of cultural organisations and education institutions applied for support from AWS, working closely as project partners on specific areas of the action plan:

- *Pilot a range of approaches to raising the profile of work in participatory settings in undergraduate courses and develop good practice guidance for placements*
- *Develop models for organisation based mentoring and sectoral knowledge exchange*

6.1 HE/FE Pilot Projects

In their phase 1 report Consilium found that 54 undergraduate and postgraduate courses across Scotland provided some level of skills development support for artists working in participatory settings, with a further 58 relevant training a CPD opportunities available.

The process of mapping the courses, training and CPD was challenging, with accurate information difficult to find either due to the absence of detail on institutions' websites or simply the absence of a central point from which to access all relevant information.

The research makes clear that *'There is a clear desire to substantially increase the number of opportunities for artists to gain hands-on practical experience within settings through high quality, structured placements'* and that *'Future developments in the provision of skills development support should also be underpinned by coordinated efforts to raise the profile of work within participatory settings amongst artists, learning providers and commissioners'*.⁵

Following further consultations with artists and other stakeholders, Consilium's concluding Phase 2 report was recommending:

- ArtWorks Scotland to raise the profile of work in participatory settings whilst informing education and career choices at an undergraduate level by piloting a series of artist/commissioner-led seminars delivered to students on art courses and commissioning a short film which displays the variety of high-quality arts-led work delivered in participatory settings. ArtWorks Scotland should also convene a meeting of HE partners in order to explore the development, piloting and evaluation of a credit-rated module on working in participatory settings. This meeting should also be used to encourage FE/HE institutions to improve the ease by which artists can identify relevant course content and learning outcomes through their respective website and prospectus.

⁵ Skillset Research and Gap Analysis for Artists Working in Participatory Settings: Phase 1 Report p27, Consilium

- ArtWorks Scotland to commission the production of guidance documentation for HE/FE institutions incorporating placements in their provision and placement providers in order to maximise the impact of placements. This document could cover all aspects of good practice to be employed by HE/FE institutions in order to support the skills development of under/post graduates taking up placement opportunities as well as guidance on the role and responsibilities of the setting in supporting an effective placement.

AWS decided to approach HE/FE institutions directly, inviting them to an event at which the research was presented, and a discussion took place about how best to move the recommendations forward.

This informed the approach taken subsequently, which involved AWS encouraging HE and FE institutions to respond to the following point of the action plan:

- *Pilot a range of approaches to raising the profile of work in participatory settings in undergraduate courses and develop good practice guidance for placements*

The following 7 pilots projects were developed:

Glasgow School of Art/New College Lanarkshire: Creative Placements (GSA/NCL)

The School of Environmental Art (SEA) at GSA worked with NCL, who provide learning centres in 7 Scottish Prisons. 14 SEA students were placed in the learning centres, working with Lecturers and prison learners, to deliver visual art projects. This project developed a new approach to placement delivery, building a solid partnership model that facilitated a greater number of placements to take place simultaneously, with high quality learning taking place for all partners (students, prison learners, learning centre staff) as a result. The project is subject of a [case study](#) by Dr Fiona Dean.

Resource: placement case study

<http://www.creativescotland.com/what-we-do/major-projects/creative-learning-and-young-people/artworks-scotland/pilot-projects/student-placements-in-prison->

Gray's School of Art, Aberdeen: Participatory Art Exchange (PAE)

Led by the School of Fine Art, this pilot introduced participatory practice to a cross section of art and design students through a series of events, and provided student placements at cultural organisations across Aberdeen city and Aberdeenshire. As well as raising the profile of participatory art, and developing a new placement model, the project aimed to tackle the issue of retention of creative talent in the area, a recognised problem, by building new networks and connections across the area and introducing new career pathways to students.

Edinburgh College: Arts in Participatory Settings: Their role in Further Education

This pilot project sought to enhance the college's stated intention of providing 'positive destinations' for students and graduates by raising awareness of the participatory arts sector as a career option across the whole School of Creative Industries. Staff were surveyed about attitudes and awareness and taster sessions were introduced at an all-staff CPD day in June 2014, with 480 staff taking part in participatory workshops.

Moray House/Edinburgh College of Art: Adopt an Artist

Students from Moray House School of Education specialising in maths and English worked in partnership with students from Edinburgh College of Art to develop new creative approaches within initial teacher training. The collection of the National Galleries of Scotland was used as an inspiration and a resource for the projects, which took place in six schools across Edinburgh. A final exhibition of the work, 'Running with Scissors' was shown at the National Galleries in partnership with the creative learning team. The longer term aim of the project is to embed the learning, offering the partnership as a way forward for both courses.

Shetland College/University of the Highlands and Islands: Networked Learning for Participatory Practices in Visual Art in the Highlands and Islands

This pilot introduced a new module in Art and Social Practice, testing methods for facilitating connectivity while teaching skills and understanding of quality in participatory practices through networking and virtual learning environments. Working with a cohort of students spread across the Highlands and Islands the module introduced new ways to facilitate learning using digital technologies, including an international virtual symposium for over 100 people, connecting 10 locations across the UK with internationally recognised practitioner Pablo Helguera from MOMA, New York as keynote speaker.

The Royal Conservatoire of Scotland

Pilot 1: Bursaries for the 'Teaching Artist' credit rated short course

AWS supported a fund to ensure that Scottish-based artists were able to take part in this newly developed course, enabling testing and evaluation of the course to take place. A primary aim of the scheme was to improve the status of the work and the artists in the eyes of employers by ensuring more quality, skilled and qualified Scottish-based artists are informing and inspiring the arts and HE sectors.

A secondary aim was to explore how blended and online learning might benefit artists in participatory settings through RCS practices and policies. Nine artists completed the course.

Pilot 2: A Student Guide to Student Placements - Working Creatively in Participatory Settings

An online resource that provides a 'students-eye-view' and articulates good practice for placements in participatory settings including guidance. The resource was commissioned from 7 students from different art forms and includes their reflections on learning and teaching within different participatory contexts. As the project developed it dovetailed with a separate piece of research exploring good practice in placements from an institutional perspective, also commissioned by AWS. The two elements have now merged to become a new website, which sits within the RCS website, but is AWS branded, and will be maintained and managed by RCS; a good example of an output that can be sustainable beyond AWS.

6.2 Mentoring Pilot Projects

Mentoring was the preferred method of professional development for artists according to the Consilium research. Their phase 2 research made the following recommendation to AWS:

- ArtWorks Scotland should promote the use and benefits of mentoring models to support mid- career and established artists to obtain the skills, knowledge and qualities required to work in participatory settings. The dissemination of guidance on appropriate CPD activities including mentoring structures and skillsets required to support work in participatory settings should be accompanied by signposting mechanisms highlighting opportunities and added value available through the Scottish Mentoring Network and existing Creative Scotland investment streams.

This informed the following action plan point:

- *Develop models for organisation based mentoring and sectoral knowledge exchange*

In response AWS proceeded to build a new network (for mentoring and the cultural sector) in partnership with the Scottish Mentoring Network, and worked with 6 organisations of varying size and across a range of artforms, to set up and test new models for organisation-based mentoring for arts in participatory settings.

Initial links were made with the Cashback for Creativity funding programme, managed by Creative Scotland, which supports a range of organisations to develop film and dance-based projects with young people. AWS provided 'top-up' funding to existing projects to develop mentoring models, with the aim of building organisational capacity and testing the impact of skills development on quality production.

AWS provided a two day accredited mentoring training course for the pilot projects and other interested organisations, delivered by the Scottish Mentoring Network. This allowed the organisations to develop new skills and capacities, embedding mentoring more deeply within their organisations.

Through the Cashback for Creativity scheme AWS supported the following organisations:

Dancehouse worked with eight professional artists from multiple disciplines and challenged them to push artistic boundaries whilst working with vulnerable or marginalised young people in participatory settings. Artist-led mentoring reflection sessions allowed artists to exchange knowledge and innovative practice.

GMAC (Glasgow Media Access Centre) focused on mentoring filmmakers with little or no engagement experience to support them to develop skills and confidence to work with the community, specifically focused on youth work.

SEE (Screen Education Edinburgh) developed ten new tutors, with six experienced lead 'creative tutors', and four mentees who were talented young people drawn from the previous Cashback for Creativity programme at SEE, with the aim of providing employment opportunities for young people from disadvantaged backgrounds in Edinburgh.

AWS also supported three cultural organisations with an existing interest in developing mentoring; Royal Scottish National Orchestra (RSNO), the Traditional Music Forum (TMF) and Luminate.

TMF (The Traditional Music Forum) pilot developed reflective practice within the organisation to enable musicians to better identify factors which support quality in participatory settings, and organisations to better understand how to commission musicians' participatory practice

Luminate, Scotland's festival of creative ageing, embedded mentoring into a specific participatory project with older people, where an experienced maker of theatre for older people supported three less experienced artists who had been commissioned to work with different groups.

The **RSNO (Royal Scottish National Orchestra)** did not complete the project due to a change of staff, and extended hand-over delays.

Scottish Mentoring Network(SMN) - Working from the recommendations of the Consilium reports AWS made contact with the Scottish Mentoring Network (SMN) and worked in partnership with them to set up a 'thematic network for culture' as well as capacity building training for cultural organisations. The thematic Network for Culture has held 2 events and will continue to be developed and maintained through SMN, in partnership with Creative Scotland. SMN has comprehensive guidance for its members on mentoring and has developed a cultural sector supplement with AWS.

This exemplifies how the AWS aims of creating sustainability by embedding activity in existing structures beyond the life of the project can be achieved.

6.3 Knowledge Exchange between Creative Practitioners and Learning Practitioners

AWS research focused on 3 setting-specific skillsets, one of which was artists working in schools. In the consultations, the role of the Local Authority-based Creative Learning Networks was noted, and it was agreed that knowledge and understanding of the Curriculum for Excellence, was 'key' as was the 'ability to effectively link activities to the curriculum'.⁶

The phase 2 research also recommended that Creative Scotland should assess the continued relevance and appropriateness of existing setting specific guidance materials (e.g. documents and short films) with any identified gaps filled and through the commissioning of new resources. All resources should be validated by commissioners and published online in order to maximise access to artists, commissioners and funders.

The AWS work in this area related to the following action point in the plan:

- *Develop models for organisation based mentoring and sectoral knowledge exchange*

In partnership with Education Scotland and Creative Scotland, AWS supported 5 Creative Learning Networks (CLN's) to develop programmes of continuing professional development to facilitate knowledge exchange between learning practitioners and creative practitioners.

Projects were selected through an application process, and awarded funds provided from Creative Scotland's Creative Learning, Education and Young People portfolio. AWS provided additional support to the programme, providing a researcher and a film maker, to document the projects and consult closely on the development of a proposed setting specific guidance resource for artists and schools.

The projects, based in Aberdeen City, Angus, Edinburgh City, Forth Valley and Inverclyde, adopted different approaches to facilitating knowledge exchange, including structured mentoring courses for recent graduates, a drop-in space for artists and teachers to take part in joint discussions and inspirational seminar events with keynote speakers.

All 5 project teams were brought together for two 'Sharing the Learning' days during 2014, facilitated by Paul Collard of Creativity, Culture and Education.

⁶ Skillset Research and Gap Analysis for Artists Working in Participatory Settings: Phase 1 Report, p38, Consilium

AWS supported a consultant artist researcher and a film maker to work alongside these projects, capturing and documenting key shared learning, and consulting with the project leads to develop recommendations for an information and quality guidance resource for creative practitioners working with learning practitioners, and anyone else in both sectors seeking to develop creative projects.

The draft recommendations for developing the resource involve a two pronged approach that provides both practical guidance and sources of inspiration for artists and learning providers, available online and embedded within the existing AWS pages on the Creative Scotland website.

The practical guidance would include signposting to training, networks, mentoring and other CPD, as well as condensed information on policy and curriculum, and a quick guide or check-list. This would be backed up with guides to self-evaluation and quality guidance.

Case studies, links to films, and reading and research materials are recommended as inspiration sources, as well as material on lesson planning.

The recommendations will be reviewed, with a view to taking them forward in a subsequent phase.

7. Other Activity

A range of other activity was developed in response to the remaining Action Plan points:

• *Disseminate research and learning from the ArtWorks Scotland project to HE/ FE and other partners*

Recommendation 11 from the Consilium Phase 2 report suggests that Creative Scotland takes a lead role in raising the profile of work in participatory settings and opening up future opportunities through effective engagement of strategic partners and potential commissioners.

AWS presented the research findings to groups of HE/FE staff during events organised to consult on development of good placement practice and guidance, and the HE/FE pilot projects.

The research has featured at the annual conferences, with a general overview forming the introduction, and some break-out sessions focusing in detail on specific aspects such as quality.

A further step will be the 2014 AWS annual conference, entitled, 'Sharing the Learning', which will take place in Edinburgh in November 2014.

In addition to this all AWS research is now available online, on Creative Scotland [website](#).

Further action points include:

- *Embed learning from ArtWorks Scotland into Creative Scotland funding programmes **and***
- *Develop and publish a quality framework/ guidance for factors which support quality*

Both have begun to take place, with the AWS quality factors research and wider CS quality research and framework development as the strongest indicators of impact here (see pages 49 and 53 below for more detail)

The Quality Factors research undertaken during the initial phase of AWS, was developed further during 2014. Taking the 15 factors identified by artists (see page 48) a group of 'partners' were asked to respond to the factors in the same way, rating them according to importance, and against how often they are perceived to happen in practice.

The results can be found in [Quality Perspectives, Artists and Partners: Research background and Key Observations](#) and in an [infographic poster](#).

The AWS work to develop a quality framework has fed into a report which lays a foundation for the next steps, '*Developing a Foundation for Quality Guidance for arts organisations and artists in Scotland working in*

Resources

AWS research:

<http://www.creativescotland.com/what-we-do/major-projects/creative-learning-and-young-people/artworks-scotland/research>

Quality perspectives:

http://www.creativescotland.com/__data/assets/pdf_file/0005/26627/Quality-Perspectives-Artists-and-Partners.pdf

Infographic poster:

http://www.creativescotland.com/__data/assets/pdf_file/0008/26972/ArtWorks-Scotland-Infographics-2013.pdf

participatory settings'. Commissioned through Creative Scotland strategic Creative Scotland funds, and partly in response to the ArtWorks Scotland findings, it has been a contributing factor in highlighting the need for a consistent approach to provision of quality guidance across CS as a whole. The development of a framework is being factored into CS planning and will be taken forward at a strategic level

The CS Creative Learning team used the '*Developing a Foundation for Quality Guidance*' report to create guidance for the Creative Learning connector theme for the Regular Funding application process during July 2014, basing one section directly on the principles and conditions suggested through the report.

This was included in an assessing officers training session for the CS 'Regular Funding' scheme, with the result that learning about quality and the development of a common language is beginning to be embedded into CS.

Two remaining points have been identified and actioned as follows:

- *Develop coherent online information and connectivity* **and**
- *Develop a series of seminars and an annual event*

These build on recommendation 10 of the Phase 2 Consilium report:

'Building a strong and visible community of practice underpins the development of a coherent programme of skills development support in Scotland and improves the prospects for the catalytic impact of the ArtWorks Scotland programme. Proposed options to be considered for investment either through ArtWorks Scotland or a strategic commission via Creative Scotland include establishing an annual conference and developing an online community of practice.'

To enhance the evolving online and social networking established through AWS LinkedIn and more recently Twitter @artworksscot, both of which have +320 followers/members, ArtWorks Scotland intends to borrow from Pedagoo, a model of online and face-to-face connectivity pioneered by teachers to enable positive practice sharing. It became clear through discussions with the Pedagoo team that this could be replicated to support the growth of a community of practice for the arts in participatory settings in Scotland and further across the UK.

AWS will begin to test a similar model, entitled *ArtWorksConnect*, during October 2014, in the run up to the annual AWS conference in November, with the aim of continuing beyond the completion of ArtWorks phase 1, following agreement of appropriate resourcing to enable this.

AWS will have produced 4 annual conferences by the end of phase 1 in December 2014, and a number of seminars and events either in partnership with other organisations, or as part of the pilot consultation and delivery process.

Table 5. Annual Conferences

Year	Venue	Total Attendees	Number of days
2011	Macrobert, Stirling	98	1 day
2012	Lighthouse, Glasgow	102	2 days
2013	West Park, Dundee	154	2 days
2014	Surgeons Hall, Edinburgh	to be confirmed	1 day

Table 6. Events in partnership

Date	Event	Title	Attendees
23 April 2012	Graham Leicester	From Best Practice to Next Practice	49
9 June 2012	Eric Booth Masterclass	Activated Environment; Receptive participant'	30
1 Aug 2012	Tim Rollins and K.O.S	Seminar for Artists and Educators in partnership with Talbot Rice Gallery	47
3 Oct 2012	National Theatre of Scotland/Citizens Theatre	Future Possible Theatre	12
30 Oct 2012	Luminate Festival for Creative Aging event	Dementia Friendly Arts	30
13 March 2013	AWS event for HE/FE	Sharing Learning and consultation on Pilots	15
25 June 2013	AWS event for HE/FE	Placements in Practice'	24
3 June 2013	AWS/Scottish Mentoring Network	Thematic Network for Culture	26
23 Oct 2013	AWS/Scottish Mentoring Network	Thematic Network for Culture	45

AWS initiated events:

- 2 x 'Sharing the Learning' events with Creative Learning Networks in partnership with Education Scotland
- Evaluation training for all pilot projects in 2 parts; initial setting up, and interim reporting back
- Training sessions and 2 x 2 day residencies for PPNs
- Other events through Pilots included a networking event run by SPAN, a seminar run by NEPAN in partnership with engage Scotland and Aberdeen Art Gallery and the first of three planned academic network events.

The HE/FE pilots also initiated events to disseminate their learning and raise the profile of their work, including an exhibition at the National Galleries, participatory taster workshops at Edinburgh college all staff CPD day, final project celebratory event at Grays' School of Art and virtual symposium at Shetland College/UHI.

8. Analysis against Outcomes and Indicators

The AWS evaluation framework was used by all pilot projects and the overarching AWS programme. The following section provides an analysis of all activity against these outcomes and indicators (see table 7 below) as well as additional unexpected outcomes and learning that took place.

Table 7. AWS Outcomes and Indicators

Outcome 1. Increased connectivity and joined up thinking at all levels in the sector
<i>1. Online developments have been taken forward to another stage</i> <i>2. Artists and organisations know where to go to get information (e.g. about skillset and quality) – and rate information as more visible, coherent and useful</i> <i>3. Conference attendance in 2013 equals that of 2012 and shows a good cross artform spread; attendees report an increased sense of community of practice</i> <i>4. Academic network has good attendance at meetings with key staff signing up and a strong representation across artform and a range of institutions. Those in the network report that it is useful and contributes to connectivity</i>
Outcome 2: Better understanding of the skills, knowledge and qualities that artists need to work in participatory settings – and how to support these
<i>1. People report that tools and information are useful to them (placement guidance and case study, information produced by pilot activity online) and on how they use the information. Use of placements guidance specifically by HE/ FE and cultural organisations and reporting back that it is useful</i> <i>2. Use of placements guidance specifically by HE/ FE and cultural organisations and reporting back that it is useful</i> <i>3. Cross sectoral range attending sharing events</i> <i>4. Numbers downloading research reports</i> <i>5. HE/ FE pilots – staff and students report better understanding of skills needed and how to support artists to develop these</i>

Outcome 3: Better understanding of factors which support quality in arts in participatory settings and how to develop this

1. *Organisations and artists report that they find the factors for quality useful and the majority of factors for quality posters are disseminated – response to these is positive; People access and use factors for quality and other resources and guidance*
2. *People across artforms have access to discussion and reflection about quality, there is engagement in debate from different types of organisation, and staff at different levels*
3. *Application forms and guidance containing new areas/ criteria/ ring-fenced funding which relates to CPD of artists working in participatory settings – and/or toolkit for quality is developed*

Outcome 4: A more professional and confident sector whose work and value is perceived as important and whose voice is stronger

1. *Artists report their confidence is growing; Engagement in the programme starts to improve artists' confidence in articulating what they do and negotiating their role*
2. *In those undergraduate or postgraduate programmes where pilot activity has taken place there is evidence of increased value placed on work in participatory settings.*

Outcome 1. Increased connectivity and joined up thinking at all levels in the sector

The AWS programme was designed to respond to the need, identified at the beginning of the ArtWorks initiative, to build a more coherent sense of a 'sector', or 'community of practice', for arts in participatory settings.

The need for better connectivity was a result of many factors, including the diverse range of art forms and settings that creative practitioners may work in, the difficulty of connecting across a workforce that is primarily freelance and engaged on temporary projects, and the lack of recognition across the arts and cultural sector, and more broadly, of the professionalism and value of the work.

Evidence gathered from surveys and reports shows that there is a sense of an evolving community of practice in Scotland. All pilot projects reported on perceptions of a developing community of practice, with 7 out of 12 respondents stating that they think a community of practice has developed through AWS, and 5 saying it had developed 'in part'.

AWS has also been successful in supporting a range of new networks for artists, academics and those interested in mentoring, which between themselves have a great deal of connectivity, and will continue beyond AWS phase 1.

There is also a greater web presence for relevant information, networks and resources, with robust plans for sustainable future online

developments. In addition, AWS has been able to influence connectivity within CS working across the Creative Learning and Young People team, effecting a deeper exchange than could have been planned for at the outset.

AWS has therefore achieved this outcome, with the most significant impacts being felt within CS, and for partners and individuals directly involved in the project and its pilots, while further support is needed to continue to develop this work more widely.

Indicator 1: Online developments have been taken forward to another stage

There is now a web resource within the Creative Scotland [website](#), where information on the AWS programme, pilot projects and events can be found, alongside films, pod casts and downloads of research reports. The ArtWorks [Vimeo channel](#) currently has 43 short films, including keynote speeches, short case studies and PechaKucha presentations. All the AWS research is available, and there is a growing resource of information about the pilot projects.

AWS has also developed the following resources:

- an AWS LinkedIn Group with 320+ members, which shares regular updates on the project, as well as other relevant information
- a Twitter account with 350 + members, which will be used to deliver a series of #ArtWorksConnect events from October 2014 onwards, building online connectivity and debate in the lead up to the AWS conference in November 2014 and beyond
- Each of the PPNs has either a website or social media profile that has been well received and used

'Our Facebook page created so much immediate interaction as people shared ideas and experience with one another; that has been a rich source of exchange for us, it's really moved us forward as a network.' PATTERN network lead

- 2 x Wordpress sites; one developed as a [blog](#) specifically for the Tim Rollins project during 2012 and an AWS [conference website](#), providing legacy information from each event, and a platform for marketing future events.

Wider connections between AWS and other sectors are being made, with our PechaKucha presentations and case studies now on the IRISS [Creative quarter website](#) and the new [placements site at RCS](#) now live.

Resources

AWS programme info:
<http://bit.ly/1uJXWdD>

AWS Vimeo channel:
<http://vimeo.com/channels/artworksscotland/videos/page:1/sort:preset>

Blog:
<http://artworksscotland.wordpress.com/>

Conference website:
<http://www.artworksscotlandconference.com/>

Iriss Creative Quarter:
<http://cq.iriss.org.uk/creativity/in-the-frame/we-are-here>

RCS placements site:
<http://artworks.rcs.ac.uk/>

Longer term, plans for *ArtWorksConnect*, an online peer-led professional network, based on Pedagoo, have been agreed with CS, as part of the joint outcomes against the Creative Learning Connector theme. This will be funded from additional lottery funding in CS, and will continue to build connectedness more widely, through online events and face to face networking opportunities.

Indicator 2: Artists and organisations know where to go to get information (e.g. about skillset and quality) – and rate information as more visible, coherent and useful

This indicator refers to the artists' survey by Consilium, which found that a majority of artists rated the ease with which they could find information about courses and other CPD as adequate (suggesting room for improvement) with a further 28% rating it as either difficult or very difficult.

AWS took the decision not to create a stand-alone searchable database, as had been initially planned, due to the associated maintenance and sustainability issues. The research had told us that the CS Opportunities web tool is the most used site for artists looking for jobs and training.

Resources

Creative Scotland Opportunities:

<http://opportunities.creativescotland.com/>

AWS worked instead with the CS web development team to establish a search option on the CS Opportunities site which allows artists to filter training and other opportunities by 'Participatory practice'. The site is open to anyone to upload jobs and other opportunities, such as CPD, for the creative sector, with a light touch moderation provided by CS.

The site currently around 30 hits for participatory-specific opportunities per week, either exclusively or alongside other artforms. This compares favourably with artform-specific searches such as Music or Film, which average 150 hits per week. It is also possible to search by 'Professional Development' which currently averages 120 hits per week across all artform areas.

Further surveys to determine improved ratings have not as yet been carried out but this is an effective tool that is embedded in the sector and will continue beyond AWS phase 1.

In addition the PPNs have contributed to connectivity by providing wider networks for advocacy and support for artists at a grass roots level, as well as pathways for students in the case of PATTERN and SPAN. These PPNs have plans to continue to develop beyond the end of AWS, contributing significantly to the support infrastructure for artists in Scotland.

Indicator 3: Conference attendance in 2013 equals that of 2012 and shows a good cross artform spread; attendees report an increased sense of community of practice

Table 8. Conference attendance

Year	Venue	Total Attendees	Number of days
2011	Macrobert, Stirling	98	1 day
2012	Lighthouse, Glasgow	102	2 days
2013	West Park, Dundee	154	2 days

Conference attendees were asked to indicate what art form they represent, against the following categories;

- Visual art
- Craft
- Literature
- Media/Digital/Film
- Music
- Dance
- Theatre
- Cross/Multi-art form
- Other

Levels of attendance across artforms have been mixed, with the highest numbers from a single art form being visual arts (2012: 24%, 2013: 38%) and lowest from literature and dance (1-2% and under 6% respectively).

In 2012 17% were from theatre, and 2013 only 7%, though the same year saw a large increase in artists identifying as 'Cross Artform' which may have included performing arts ('cross artform' was the highest group overall at 39%). This indicates that AWS should consider devising strategies to improve representation across artforms in the future.

The conferences have been successful at reaching a wide cross-section of the sector, including arts organisations of varying scale, HE and FE institutions, Local Authorities, individual creative practitioners and small numbers from connected non-arts sectors e.g. social care.

At the first AWS conference in 2011, a consultation with attendees undertaken by Icecream Architecture showed a majority (79%) of respondents felt there was not a community of practice amongst artists working in participatory settings in Scotland.

Subsequent conference surveys show much more positive responses, with 80% reporting an increase in a sense of community of practice in 2012 and at least 65% of people reporting the same in 2013 (with an increased level of first time attendees at the conference). Overall this is a significant improvement and demonstrates the strong impact of these events.

'More opportunities for networking' was by far the largest element suggested for improving the sense of a growing community of practice in the same surveys.

The 2011 conference survey has provided valuable feedback about connectivity, with a majority of attendees reporting that they made connections with other artists and projects, and 2 identifying potential employers

Out of those responding to the evaluation survey across the conference years:

- In 2011, 46% of conference participants were not part of other relevant networks.
- 2012 71% people agreed or strongly agreed that they felt more connected with others working in the same field as a result of attending
- in 2013 60% had not attended ArtWorks Scotland events previously and 76% had not taken part in any other AWS activity

This shows that AWS events in themselves are playing an important role in increasing connectivity, by giving people somewhere to meet peers from their sector

Indicator 4: Levels of attendance at Thematic Network for Culture - Scottish Mentoring Network

Artists surveyed about preferred professional development methods showed a clear preference for experiential or 'on the job' learning, with mentoring cited as most popular (57%). The AWS research commissioned from Consilium research and Consultancy recommended linking with the Scottish Mentoring Network (SMN) as they provide a strong body of resources and guidance on good mentoring practice, and have a national remit. This was a good fit with the AWS aim of working towards sustainable and embedded outcomes that continue to have impact beyond 2014.

The thematic network for culture was launched through SMN on 23rd Oct 2013 and 2 further sharing events have been held. Attendance exceeded

initial targets, with 38 attendees representing 34 organisations, local authorities and practitioners at the first (target was 20 organisations) and 33 at the second. There was a good spread across artforms at both ([See Appendix](#))

SMN had not previously been strongly linked to the Cultural Sector and have been encouraged to find that there is a wide range of mentoring going on and a lively appetite for support.

'Working with Artworks to establish a thematic network for mentoring projects working in the cultural sector has been a very useful partnership for Scottish Mentoring Network. It has allowed us to reach a number of organisations we otherwise would not have encountered and start a dialogue on how mentoring can be used to the benefit of growing talent and skills of practitioners within the cultural sector. We feel that we have established a good base for this network and are looking forward to developing the partnership further.' SMN 2014

Since the event key CS staff responsible for the Scottish Youth Arts Strategy have linked with SMN, demonstrating greater connectivity within CS and beyond. As a result of AWS working across the CS Creative Learning team, all nine of the new Youth Arts Hubs will receive training in mentoring through SMN and will become members of the Thematic Networks for Culture.

Indicator 5: Academic network has good attendance at meetings with key staff signing up and a strong representation across artform and a range of institutions. Those in the network report that it is useful and contributes to connectivity.

Proposals for an academic network emerged from the AWS event for HE and FE in March 2013 during which the research was presented, and solutions to some of the key findings, in particular how to raise the profile of arts in participatory settings within HE/FE, were sought.

15 attendees from a range of Higher and Further Education institutions attended, representing a cross section of artforms, and the event was timed to prime the individual attendees prior to several going on to the ArtWorks UK conference in Lancaster in April.

The meeting reinforced awareness that art in participatory settings was most often supported and promoted within HE/FE by key individuals with a particular passion for the practice; often with little or no formal support from the institution itself.

AWS recognised the importance of these individuals to the sector as a whole and sought to harness their support for the programme at the outset, to help sustain support for AWS networks and pilot projects beyond 2014.

It was suggested that these individuals required better support to continue the work, and a peer network could provide a vehicle for this, as well as potentially being a key element of the developing infrastructure to support artists more broadly

AWS invited proposals to set up a national network for academics invested in the arts in participatory settings, and has supported a partnership between Glasgow School of Art (GSA) and The Royal Conservatoire (RCS) to take the initiative forward. Entitled, 'A Creative Convention', there has been one meeting to date, with 15 attendees, including:

- National Theatre of Scotland,
- Royal Conservatoire of Scotland
- University of West of Scotland
- Queen Margaret University
- Focus West
- Sheffield University
- Impact Arts

Further meetings were delayed due to a devastating fire at GSA with the next meeting taking place in September 2014.

An attendee reported the reasons for attending as:

'To stay connected with other people working in a similar or interconnected field of practice, listening and learning from each other and staying linked in with developments'.

Outcome 1: Unintended outcomes/other learning for 'Increased Connectivity and Joined up Thinking at all levels in the sector.'

The need for an ongoing co-ordination role

A community of practice is developing however continued development of this activity is dependent on a coordinating presence leading a planned programme.

'The national conferences connected practitioners across Scotland...however without the framework of ArtWorks Scotland and the regular events & conferences, it is hard to see how this will continue' Peer to Peer network member

AWS is currently exploring ways to take this forward.

Cross Art Form exchange

An unexpected positive outcome has been the high value placed by creative practitioners on cross art form exchange:

'The research underlined the importance and value of cross subject working.' Dean, 2014 P16

'It was clear the cross art form approach was both challenging and enriching for the artistic teams.' Mentoring Pilot Organisation

'It has been particularly beneficial to gain an insight into how other art forms engage with and deliver participatory projects and to meet 'commissioners' etc.' HE Pilot Project Lead

The Value of Intra Career Stage Exchange

Additionally, exchange and connectivity across career stage has been valuable. PATTERN in particular developed a significant student membership, providing a 'bridge' into professional practice on graduation.

More unexpectedly were reports of the value to experienced practitioners of their interaction (through PPNs and placement projects) with students and emerging artists. A Peer to peer network lead reported that this was *'refreshing to practice'*.

An established artist working with students on placement as part of an HE pilot project stated,

'It was incredibly useful to have students who were willing to learn and explore the process of 'social engagement' and to whom I could pass on skills - the process of this made me think about my own way of 'doing things' and reflect on how it could be more efficient and/or effective.'

The GSA/NCL Prison Placements project similarly reports on the positive benefits on the teaching staff of working with students.

HE/FE and lack of Internal Connectedness

Consilium reported on the difficulty of:

- Finding relevant information about courses with participatory arts content on institution's websites
- Making contact with the right staff in HE and FE institutions to interview for the research.

This points to a lack of connectedness within institutions, highlighting that for some institutions there is a need to join up their own internal thinking and practice before connectivity with external partners can be increased.

Making it Stick

Gaining support from the correct level of seniority within an institution is reported by pilots as a key factor for success. With sustainability in mind, Edinburgh College, Moray House and Shetland College/UHI invested significant amounts of planning time in creating strategic links with senior staff, in order to make their work 'stick'.

'Persevere with administrative bureaucracies' HE Pilot Project Lead

'Involve admin and governance if you can (for smaller organisations)' Mentoring Pilot Project Lead

'Make sure your organisation is connected first, as a foundation'
Notes from evaluation workshop participant

A final reflection on connectivity is that the arts sector may have a tendency to look inwards on itself to find solutions that could better be sought externally, in other sectors; for example in mentoring. While there is a great deal of mentoring going on across the arts, with some pockets of very good practice, much is ad hoc, and there were few existing links to SMN. Connection with an expert body will help raise the quality of mentoring in the arts in Scotland.

Recommendations for Outcome 1: Increased connectivity and joined up thinking at all levels in the sector

1. Continue to support the development of the community of practice with further annual conferences, online and face-to-face events
2. Develop social media presence, keeping in mind the value of cross artform exchange, reflective practice and networking, though Twitter events and development of ArtWorksConnect plans
3. Continue to work across CS, embedding learning and sharing practice, including inputting to staff training and guidance and working across the Creative Learning team
4. Review and Continue to support the national academic network

Outcome 2: Better understanding of the skills, knowledge and qualities that artists need to work in participatory settings – and how to support these

AWS has made significant progress against this outcome, with good indications that it will be achieved more fully as evaluation and learning materials are produced and disseminated more widely in the latter stages of the project.

The ArtWorks programme was conceived as a workforce development scheme, identifying the need for further understanding of the skills, knowledge and qualities that artists need to develop high quality work in participatory settings, in order to provide 'a better infrastructure for training and development of artists at all stages of their careers' (PHF Outcome 3)

In order to achieve this AWS commissioned Consilium Research and Consultancy to carry out a two stage skill set research and a gaps analysis in 2011 for artists training to work in participatory settings in Scotland, which included a survey and in-depth consultations with artists. From this, Consilium made a set of recommendations, which underpinned the AWS action plan.

Key messages from the artists' survey were:

- Just 8% stated their undergraduate course had prepared them to work in participatory settings
- Three quarters would be willing to pay for high quality and relevant training to support their work in participatory settings
- The overwhelming majority of artists believe that more specialist courses and other professional development opportunities should exist for artists working in participatory settings
- The most effective method for the majority of artists was to learn from active practitioners through observation and mentoring
- Expanding this opportunity across all career stages should be 'the cornerstone' of a skills development programme.

Lists of competencies required by artists to work in 3 specific settings; Prisons, with older people and in schools were generated through the consultation process, and cross-referenced to produce a set of core competencies that applied to all settings, mirroring the suggestions provided through the wider artists survey. These included:

- Adaptability
- Ability to build rapport
- Commitment to continuous learning
- Group working skills
- Observational skills

- Organisational skills
- Being a reflective practitioner
- Team working with other professionals
- Versatility

In response to the findings, AWS developed a partnership model to support a range of pilot projects in HE/FE and funded arts organisations. An action research approach was used to test the range of professional development methods employed. The pilots were invited to share learning at 2 evaluation workshops. This responsive and flexible approach has helped build capacity for continued skills development within the sector, and to support the development of a community of practice by networking the projects.

All pilots offered experiential learning opportunities such as mentoring and placements. In addition further research was commissioned with the aim of producing guidance for specific areas, such as placements, and between artists and learning professionals. All pilots have reported a better understanding of the skills knowledge and qualities that artists need to work in participatory settings, and how to support this.

Indicator 1: People report that tools and information are useful to them (placement guidance and case study, information produced by pilot activity online) and on how they use the information

During 2013/14 AWS supported 12 pilot projects in partnership with cultural and education institutions and organisations, and worked with Education Scotland and Creative Learning Networks to support a further 5 CPD pilots (as well as ongoing support for the 5 Peer to Peer Artists Networks).

By adopting an action research approach, AWS encouraged groups and organisations to develop bespoke solutions to lines of enquiry emerging from the research that were relevant to them, and to report back about their learning. Tools and information have been or are being currently developed (at Oct 14) as the pilot projects conclude and will be disseminated at a later date.

There is the new placement guidance website (see Outcome 1, Indicator 1 for link) and a mentoring guidance supplement for the cultural sector, developed in partnership with Scottish Mentoring Network.

In addition, in 2012 AWS published research on factors supporting quality, resulting from in-depth consultation with the 5 peer to peer artists networks. A further report, 'Developing a Foundation for Quality

Resources

AWS research on factors supporting quality

http://www.creativescotland.com/__data/assets/pdf_file/0007/26971/ArtWorks-Scotland-Infographics-2012.pdf

Guidance for arts organisations and artists in Scotland working in participatory settings⁷ was commissioned (from CS strategic funds) as a stepping stone to producing guidance on quality. The factors for quality were subsumed into this broader approach as 'conditions' for quality. This report is awaiting publication with a view to using the learning to inform CS quality guidance and approaches.

To date we can identify some impacts from the initial AWS research, with RCS reporting that they used 'ArtWorks research reports to inform professional development course planning.'

While some of the planned resources are still to be produced and disseminated, information on the HE/FE pilot projects has been available on the AWS web pages on the CS website since July 2014. This is very recent, and there is no current information about levels of access.

Indicator 2. Use of placements guidance specifically by HE/ FE and cultural organisations and reporting back that it is useful

AWS held an event on 25th June at RCS, attended by 25 stakeholders from HE, FE and arts organisations, to share good practice and new thinking on student placements, and to scope out the need for guidance, for which there was a clear demand. There was also much discussion about a more ambitious approach to developing a 'one stop shop' for placement brokering across Scotland, which was not taken forward, due to the need for AWS to consider sustainability, and how best to work within existing systems.

AWS supported a pilot at RCS, to produce a handbook on placements from a student's perspective. In addition a consultant was appointed to develop guidance for HE/ FE and host organisations. In partnership with RCS these areas of enquiry have been merged into a single [online resource](http://artworks.rcs.ac.uk/) (see also Outcome 1, indicator 1) which has an AWS identity but will be maintained and developed by RCS; an exemplar of the AWS aim to create sustainable resources as a legacy to the project.

Resources

Online placement resource
<http://artworks.rcs.ac.uk/>

Indicator 3. Cross sectoral range attending sharing events

AWS has delivered a number of events over the course of the project, (see table 7: Events in Partnership). All events have attracted an excellent cross section of art forms and representatives from across the sector, including independent artists, Local Authorities, HE and FE and arts organisations and commissioners. Attendees at the Mentoring Network included national organisations such as National Galleries of

⁷ Blanche 2014

Scotland, National Theatre of Scotland, Royal Conservatoire of Scotland, Scottish National Portrait Gallery, Scottish Screen Archive, Scottish Youth Theatre and Young Scot. See [Appendix](#) for full attendance list.

Some events have been more attractive to those well established in their careers, but there has also been a good representation from across career stages, with the value of this type of exchange to all stages already reported on above.

Indicator 4: Numbers downloading research reports

Indicator 5. HE/ FE pilots – staff and students report better understanding of skills needed and how to support artists to develop these

The HE/FE pilots had a direct focus on developing learning approaches to build the skills, knowledge and experience of students, to enable them to work successfully in participatory settings. The approaches were either through directly taught programmes (RCS Teaching Artist, Shetland College Art and Social Practice module) or through experiential learning opportunities, such as placements in schools, prison learning centres or cultural organisations.

The capacity of each institution to provide these new and, in some cases experimental, learning opportunities was significantly enhanced. The RCS developed greater knowledge and understanding about blended learning models through the implementation of their Teaching Artist pilot, while Shetland College/UHI gained new skills in creating networked learning and virtual learning environments. GSA forged strong links with NCL and has a much enhanced level of understanding about the levels of preparation and management required to successfully deliver a complex student placement programme in prisons. Gray's School of Art strengthened the support infrastructure across Aberdeen and Aberdeenshire for provision of student placements in the future, and increased the potential for joint working across the region.

Every pilot project has reported back in detail on the learning from their project, and the extent to which they believe they have a better understanding of the skills needed to work in participatory settings and how to support artists to develop these. The majority reported an emphatic 'yes' to this question.

For the GSA, research reports that

'Students are able to test their skills, knowledge and abilities in practice; reflecting on these, adjusting their approach and building up their experience for future challenges. That may in effect be the provision of 'training', however, it is learning that grows out of an openness rather than being overly defined at the outset'.⁸

⁸ Fiona Dean case study

Gray's School of Art reports;

'Whilst it is acknowledged that the term 'participatory' lends itself to a degree of ambiguity it is essential to engage students with this term and the contexts in which it can be applied, especially around the areas of 'interaction' with others' and 'art in public space'. Participatory Art Exchange has alerted us to the opportunity to introduce students to graduates with a range of career activities, more accurately reflecting what our graduates go on to do.' Gray's Project Final Report

Outcome 2: Unintended outcomes/other learning from 'Better understanding of the skills, knowledge and qualities that artists need to work in participatory settings – and how to support these'

Lack of consistent understanding of 'skills' terminology in sector

Consilium found there was a lack of distinction between the use of the terms 'skills', 'knowledge' and 'qualities'. Several stakeholders suggested that it was more helpful to understand 'core competencies' rather than try to define a rigid skill set.

The pilot projects have highlighted that the way that the terms 'skills' and 'training' are understood in HE/FE and more broadly across the arts are not consistent. There is evidence to suggest (e.g. from feedback from the Eric Booth masterclass) that many artists are very happy to engage in skills analysis, while others are less comfortable with these terms, viewing them as potentially prescriptive or mechanistic, and therefore potentially unsympathetic to a creative practice. In some cases a preference for using other definitions that side-step these terms is perceptible.

Recognition of skills can build confidence

A process of consultation and reflection has been embedded in the majority of the pilot projects allowing students, trainees/mentees and in some cases mentors, to reach a much more positive understanding of their existing strengths in terms of skills, knowledge and qualities. For most the outcome has been very positive, and has resulted in a stronger sense of confidence about their abilities and status. (For more about confidence see Outcome 4)

This suggests that there is role for ArtWorks to continue to work with artists to build a deeper understanding of their skills and qualities, and show how this can positively impact on confidence and validate professional practice.

Importance of reflective practice

Reflection is consistently cited as key to professional development for artists working in participatory settings. Dance House reported that *'Action based critical reflection allowed the artists to articulate their approach by discussing skills they currently had or were developing.'* Pilot Project Final Report

Recommendations for Outcome 2: Better understanding of the skills, knowledge and qualities that artists need to work in participatory settings – and how to support these

5. Continue to work with the Scottish Mentoring Network to hold events and facilitate the thematic network for culture
6. Develop guidance for CS around CPD for work in participatory settings and/or create links to guidance developed by other UK ArtWorks partners in order to encourage organisations to embed high quality CPD for artists into project plans

Outcome 3: Better understanding of factors which support quality in arts in participatory settings and how to develop this

The ArtWorks initiative seeks to gain a better understanding of what constitutes quality in the work, thus ensuring better experiences for participants. Quality is a highly complex area around which there is much debate. In order to gain a better understanding of what it is and how to achieve it more consistently, AWS undertook research during 2012 that focussed on the Peer to Peer Networks, to identify factors which best support quality work, as part of a wider piece of research by Dr Fiona Dean.⁹

Through in-depth consultation with PPN members, 15 factors for quality were identified:

1. Being involved in research, planning and development with all partners/participants
2. Being involved in evaluation and documentation with all partners/participants
3. Having time to think and reflect as part of a project

⁹ Learning from ArtWorks Scotland Peer to Peer Networks, Dean, 2012

4. Professional development opportunities as part of a project
5. A brief that allows creative input
6. Feeling professionally valued within a project
7. Having 'buy in' and trust between all partners/participants
8. Time to build relations between all partners/participants
9. Realistic expectations of what can be achieved in the time and resource
10. Numbers of participants are realistic in terms of time budget and aims
11. Understanding between all partners of what each can offer one another
12. Adequate resources - financial and other - to support planning, deliver and evaluation
13. A contract that makes clear everyone's roles, tasks and expectations
14. A dedicated project manager
15. Creative approaches to evaluation

These were rated by suggested importance, and also by how often they happen. This allowed for a comparison to be made between the two, highlighting areas that, from the artist's perspective, should be a focus for quality improvement.

The findings were presented in an infographic leaflet, which is available online, has been widely distributed at conferences and events across the UK, and has been very positively received.

It has been reprinted twice, with a total of 1300 leaflets distributed.

The same factors were tested with a range of project partners in 2013, defined in the research as, *'people who work with artists as employers, managers, commissioners or coordinators such as teachers, Creative Learning Network members and staff from the NHS, Community Development and Scottish Prison Service. The central criterion was that partners were not artists'*.

A group of these partners were surveyed and asked the same questions about quality as the artists, and asked to make the same comparisons:

- Identifying the importance of the quality factors to producing quality arts in participatory settings
- Identifying how often they were perceived to happen in practice.

Resources

Infographic leaflet:

http://www.creativescotland.com/__data/assets/pdf_file/0007/26971/ArtWorks-Scotland-Infographics-2012.pdf

Partners were also asked to reflect on usefulness and suggest any further factors for consideration. A second infographic leaflet was produced in 2013, to share these findings, with around 500 distributed to date.

When surveyed, artists and partners were largely in agreement about importance of key factors, with those to do with feeling professionally valued and having buy-in and trust from all parties most aligned.

Overall partners ranked the importance of the factors lower than artists (fewer ranked as 'essential') and tended to say they happened more often in practice. This may be accounted for by the fact that the participating partners were very experienced in the field, and artists may be referencing work with other partners who in structuring projects gave less attention to planning, set up and professional development for artists.

According to Dean, this

'is where the potential dissonance appears to lie...(it) introduces issues for discussion between artists and partnerswhile there may be some consensus on the importance of the factors, there is a suggested disparity in sense of frequency of these factors happening in practice, and that for artists, factors that are seen as essential and important to support quality, may have potential to happen more frequently.'

Since this work, CS commissioned the report '*Developing a Foundation for Quality Guidance for arts organisations and artists in Scotland working in participatory settings*'¹⁰ This connects to the AWS programme, and will act as a stepping stone to the development of quality guidance for CS and the sector. It has been very well received by those who the key concepts have been shared with to date and will be published in early 2015.

In addition, recommendations for an online teacher/artist quality guidance resource are being considered, following research that ran alongside the Creative Learning Networks pilot projects, and it is recommended that the proposals are taken forward.

AWS has made good progress in developing a better understanding of factors which support quality in arts in participatory settings and how to develop this, with the greatest impacts felt within CS and across the AWS pilot projects, and in part by those connecting more widely through events. This is a good foundation on which to build.

Resources

Infographic leaflet:

http://www.creativescotland.com/__data/assets/pdf_file/0008/26972/ArtWorks-Scotland-Infographics-2013.pdf

¹⁰ '*Developing a Foundation for Quality Guidance for arts organisations and artists in Scotland working in participatory settings*'

Indicator 1: Organisations and artists report that they find the factors for quality useful and the majority of factors for quality posters are disseminated – response to these is positive; People access and use factors for quality and other resources and guidance

Views on the factors for quality infographic leaflets were sought in the post-conference surveys of 2012 and 2013. In 2012 80% of respondents rated it as useful or interesting, and in 2013 80% of respondents rated it as useful or potentially useful.

Comments from individual survey respondents included:-

'It would make sense for a framework like this to become common practice'

'I believe they are a start in helping to shape the dialogue between artists, partners and participants but only if used in a transparent and open forum. If we quantify them as quality factors they risk being re-appropriated into an idea of standards which will not be useful for anyone. They have potential to form a blueprint for questions that we can use to develop the project in the best way possible for all'

'I feel these are concerns for very specific types of practitioners. I think it is more useful for institutions than artists'

'They're also questions they can ask of each other in peer to peer gatherings'

This shows that there is a good level of engagement with this thinking, but that some remain unconvinced about the need for quality frameworks. There can be a tendency, as witnessed at the AWS conference 2013, to conflate 'standards' with 'standardisation', creating suspicion that quality frameworks are prescriptive, rather than a potentially valuable tool to support artists.

Indicator 2: People across artforms have access to discussion and reflection about quality, there is engagement in debate from different types of organisation, and staff at different levels

As well as the quality factors research, AWS has delivered a range of opportunities to take part in events and discussions on quality. Each annual conference has included keynote speeches by leading practitioners in the field, and has included an international and UK-wide perspective, as well as an overview of high quality Scottish-based practice. In 2012 Rob Laycock and Toby Lowe of Helix Arts presented their quality framework and led a discussion on the subject. The 2013 conference included a session with Mary Schwarz on the quality factors research, involving respondents from the survey reflecting with others on the usefulness of the factors in practice to their area of work.

The AWS LinkedIn grouping provides a platform to share good practice and case studies, although this is not as well used as it could be, and the new Twitter account will be used to stimulate more discussion through online events in the lead up to the 2014 conference and beyond.

The CS Creative Learning Connector theme used the '*Developing a Foundation for Quality Guidance for arts organisations and artists in Scotland working in participatory settings*' report to create guidance for the Regular Funding application process, basing one section directly on the principles and conditions suggested through the report.

This was the subject of an assessing officers training for the CS 'Regular Funding' scheme, with the result that learning about quality and the development of a common language is beginning to be embedded into CS.

Indicator 3: Application forms and guidance containing new areas/ criteria/ ring-fenced funding which relates to CPD of artists working in participatory settings – and/or toolkit for quality is developed

Within Creative Scotland the impact of the AWS programme is being felt, with an identifiable conceptual change that builds on the AWS approach

The new fund for Regularly Funded organisations, deadline July, required organisations to clearly state their intentions against a list of criteria developed from the quality conditions and principles that emerged from the '*Developing a Foundation for Quality Guidance for arts organisations and artists in Scotland working in participatory settings*' report, connecting to the AWS programme.

As a direct result of the AWS programme, the same approach to creating an evaluation framework (in partnership with AWS) was adopted across the Creative Learning and Young People team in Creative Scotland. Evaluation Support Scotland delivered two half-day sessions to develop shared outcomes (to refer to internally) in order to build a more strategic approach.

The programmes working under Creative Learning and Young People are Creative Learning Networks, the Youth Strategy and Youth Hubs, Youth Music Initiative, Cashback for Creativity and ArtWorks; responsible for total funding of £38 Million over 3 years. Themes which outcomes have been set against are: Connectivity, Practice Development, Quality, Progression and Equalities. An example outcome (for quality) is - Greater shared understanding, common language & approach across all programmes

Learning from AWS is currently also being fed into the guidance for Open funding. Final guidance will be available in October 2014.

Outcome 3: Unintended outcomes/other learning from 'Better understanding of factors which support quality in arts in participatory settings and how to develop this'

Deeper connections across CS developed

The developments across the Creative Learning and Young People team at CS are extremely positive unintended outcomes for AWS. They supersede initial plans to embed AWS learning within CS, and offer a deeper route into these programmes alongside the development of guidance.

Consilium recommended that ArtWorks worked across funding streams in CS. As new opportunities arose through restructuring and review, and more projects came into the remit of the Portfolio Manager for Education, Learning and Young People, unforeseen opportunities to learn from the AWS evaluation approach were identified and used across the new connector theme for creative learning.

This has been possible due to the structure of the AWS team, which includes a Creative Scotland staff member who is well placed to connect with other staff internally and embed AWS outcomes within CS.

Other learning from the pilots projects connected to issues of quality include:

The importance of planning and preparation to create 'buy-in'

Moray House reported on the positive impact that the extensive planning and preparation allowed by the pilot funding had on delivery of quality, and the importance of spending time 'getting everyone on board'.

The importance of contracts

Dancehouse found that ensuring contracts have explicit information about meeting requirements and early date setting can help when working with freelancers, for both parties.

Moray House found the writing of a contract which students were given to make their roles clear was a 'major useful support'. This ensured that expectations of each other were aligned, gave them a reference point as the project developed and formalised their commitment to the projects.

Recommendations for Outcome 3: Better understanding of factors which support quality in arts in participatory settings and how to develop this

7. Continue to distribute existing quality factors research through infographics available as leaflets or online
8. Develop research into quality guidance for CS with input from the sector, including period for testing
9. Review the 'Quality Guidance Resource for Artists and Learning Providers' report with a view to actioning recommendations.

Outcome 4: A more professional and confident sector whose work and value is perceived as important and whose voice is stronger

Arts in participatory settings is widely perceived, by artists and other stakeholders, to occupy a lower status than other areas of artistic practice. It also has a low profile within HE and FE arts courses, despite a significant proportion of artists going on to work in the sector after graduation. The effect of this is a perceived lack of confidence across the field, that can result in artists being unsure of the value of their 'offer', how to articulate their skills and qualities, and as a result, how to agree terms and conditions.

AWS consulted with HE and FE institutions about how they would go about raising the profile of participatory arts within their programmes, and invited them to test these proposals as pilot projects, some of which also explored good practice in placements.

AWS also asked all pilot projects to report back on whether the voice of participatory arts was stronger in their organisation as a result of the programme, and if their value was perceived to be higher. All report that the voice has become stronger and the value has increased.

We can conclude that we have successfully impacted on this outcome, taking the view that the programme continues to make 'small wins' within a very wide network of institutions and their staff and students, incrementally increasing the perceived value of arts in participatory settings and strengthening its voice.

Indicator 1: Artists report their confidence is growing; Engagement in the programme starts to improve artists' confidence in articulating what they do and negotiating their role.

The 2012 conference survey shows that 71% of those who responded reported feeling more confident about working in participatory settings, having attended, and the 2013 Conference survey showed that 43% did. (60% had not attended AWS events previously). There are many examples from the consultation with Peer to Peer Artist Networks about the extent to which the experience has boosted confidence.

"The PPN is Artist led ...That's given us much more confidence, given us a better voice." Artists Peer to Peer Network lead

One PPN lead states that they are now, *'able to work with commissioners on a more level footing and.... able to negotiate throughout a project with confidence and self-belief.'*

A mentoring pilot project lead reported that artists *'have improved confidence and understanding of working with older people'* and another that mentees, *'naturally grew in confidence'*.

The case study research found that prison learning centre staff indicated that the project had *'helped them to become more aware of their strengths; how and what they really excel at in their jobs; their considerable skills and attributes'*.

Indicator 2: In those undergraduate or postgraduate programmes where pilot activity has taken place there is evidence of increased value placed on work in participatory settings.

Of the 5 HE/FE Pilots that reported back, all state that the value of the work is perceived to have increased, with only one stating 'in part'. The difficulty of achieving this in the short time frame is noted; these are seen as long terms goals. Questions over how to determine the baseline remain. However, alongside increased value placed on participatory work, there is good evidence that the pilots have been successful in raising awareness of the participatory arts in general, and their value as a career path for graduates.

One of the FE pilot projects reports that

'Staff have expressed an interest in learning more about arts in participatory settings, as well as a desire to participate in Arts workshops themselves, the College Learning and Development team have asked us to contribute to future CPD events and the Headhas stated an intention to review the pilot recommendations and explore how they can be implemented in a phased and funded way.' FE Pilot Project Lead

Another FE pilot project provided good evidence of the resulting increased credibility of participatory arts, and of the confidence that new teaching methods developed:

'I am very heartened by my...colleagues' interest in a subject which we have not previously addressed formally in our

curriculum. I feel I have gained respect within my institution as a result of the project.....and my work is better understood and valued because I can see that colleagues can see benefit of the work we have undertaken impacting on students' work in other modules.' FE Pilot Project Lead

An HE institution found that;

'The project has demonstrated there is sufficient demand from undergraduatesto continue to deliver some form of the pilot in the future... Following submission of a proposalthe University has agreed to make £30,000 of 'Strategic Funding' available in session 2014-15' HE Pilot Project Lead

GSA and NCL have agreed allocation and sharing of resources for a phase 2 of the pilot, with a few modifications to the project based on their learning, such as students receiving briefs, and for the same number of students (14) to undertake placements.

Commitment to continuing the programmes is clear evidence of value placed on the pilots and therefore of the greater value now placed on participatory arts.

Outcome 4: Unintended outcomes/other learning from 'A more professional and confident sector whose work and value is perceived as important and whose voice is stronger'.

Several individuals note the difficulty of running networks and difficulty for freelancers to commit to training.

'Networks require a lot of time and energy to sustain' PPN Lead

An organisation supporting a mentoring pilot found it was hard for experienced freelancers to commit time;

'Experienced freelancers are often unable to commit to any sort of CPD or training to become a trainer themselves...The training day allowed us to gather like-minded individuals so collectively they were able to sympathise and exchange information'

Mentoring Pilot Project Lead

From this experience they are now considering offering training in a shorter time period as this might suit this industry better.

Other projects similarly note that mentoring requires more commitment and support from the host organisation than expected.

Availability of time was also an issue for the Peer to Peer Networks, with one in particular noting that it was hard to manage their large online network, and recognising that the lead artist's management role was a challenge to deliver.

Recommendations for Outcome 4: A more professional and confident sector whose work and value is perceived as important and whose voice is stronger

10. Taking on board the principle of incremental 'small wins' across large networks, find ways to continue to work with pilot project partners to support further dissemination of their learning
11. Recognise the challenges to the continued development of confidence and professionalism that the lack of time and resources across the sector bring, and commit to continued provision of leadership and resources to build on impacts to date.
12. Continue to work effectively across the UK with legacy activity from all pathfinders

9. Embedding and Sustainability

All the HE/FE pilot projects report that they will continue work towards embedding their learning into their institutions.

The project at Gray's School of Art has highlighted the positive impact of bringing together the research and undergraduate communities, specifically in relation to participatory contexts. Participatory work will feature more prominently in the '*Life After Art School*' (LAAS) programme of events for under-graduates, and the Fine Art department will continue to grow placement opportunities with all project partners. The pilot has also made connections with other areas within the University, and is currently part of a bid for a joint project that connects participatory placements with a wider move to create more collaborative opportunities for retention of creative talent in the city of Aberdeen.

Creative Industries staff at Edinburgh College have expressed an interest in learning more about Arts in Participatory Settings as well as a desire to participate in Arts workshops themselves. The College Learning and Development team have asked for continued contribution to future staff CPD events and there is a stated intention by the Head of Creative Industries to review the pilot recommendations and explore how they can be implemented in a phased and funded way. For example, future plans include continued exploration of further strategic development and validation of arts in participatory settings across Edinburgh College. Investigating bringing the Arts Education in Practice Professional Development Award into the college as a 'bolt-on' course for students and staff has also been recommended.

The partnership approach developed at cross-university level and at subject level through the Moray House/Edinburgh College of Art pilot will continue to influence working practices there and has opened up new ways of creating links to support knowledge transfer.

The RCS Placements guidance work and new website resource has enabled access to peer to peer learning on placements within participatory contexts for students both inside and outwith the RCS, and created improvements to the design and access to the knowledge exchange areas of the RCS and short course website for future and current project outputs to sit within.

A stronger internal rationale regarding placements within participatory contexts has developed within the RCS's new curriculum, where all students are to be offered the opportunity to undertake a placement during their studies.

The RCS Teaching Artist short course has helped to improve resources, processes and procedures related to professional development training at RCS, and the design of new modules as part of the wider Post Graduate Curriculum Reform process, to make them fit for practising contemporary artists' contexts. It has also helped to create a better informed Online, Distance and Blended Learning strategy in RCS Short Courses, and new joint working ambitions with RCS Information Services and Learning Technology colleagues.

Shetland College/University of Highlands and Islands aims to continue to deliver virtual symposia, and in the longer term to develop a new networked and virtual MA Art and Social Practice. In the shorter term it will continue to deliver the Art and Social Practice module, to a wider range of subject area students than during the pilot year. The module descriptors for both the undergraduate and graduate level modules have been modified and approved by the Faculty Board to improve the content and delivery in future.

The mentoring pilots reported back on the longer term benefits of the projects in detail, with significant evidence that the impacts have extended beyond the individual projects and across organisations more widely, and have influenced other organisations. The success of these pilots has created ambition for further development, including more strategic approaches to partnership working, such as development of new training courses and joining the Scottish Mentoring Network. SMN are developing guidance specifically for the cultural sector as a result of this work, and will host this into the future.

For GMAC, benefits include having a new pool of engaged 'professionals' who may go on to work on future projects. The pilot further encouraged the nurturing of talent through the Youth programmes using the mentoring system, increasing the freelance pool. All staff who undertook the mentoring training are going on to achieve an SQA qualification.

Dancehouse acknowledges the importance of mentoring at all stages of career and understands the value it can have. Being part of the pilot programme gave Dance Houses' Community Development Manager experience of mentoring through which she was encouraged to take part in her own career based Mentoring Scheme to add value and perspective. The ArtWorks pilot enhanced the existing programme, allowing reflection on practice and artistic skills required for delivering high quality arts in participatory settings and better support for artists.

The Luminate project was valuable for all artists involved, with identifiable long-term benefit being a better understanding of how to support emerging artists who are taking part in Luminate, and a continued collaboration across all partners beyond the life of the project.

Screen Education Edinburgh's approach has benefited markedly from the project, with a new cohort of trained tutors available for projects. The process assisted SEE in the preparation of a Professional Development Award in Film Tutoring, with Queen Margaret University and Edinburgh Napier University on board, to support accreditation, and Skillset as a potential funder.

Their mentoring of the trainees has proven particularly fruitful and paves the way for the development of a yearlong young people's apprenticeship programme, with young people learning key skills including tutoring, whilst achieving the qualification of Diploma in Creative Digital Media Practice.

The Traditional Music Forum project has extended beyond the organisation, influencing the Scottish Music Group and TRACS (Traditional Arts and Culture Scotland) to include provision for mentoring training and support, and connection to Scottish Mentoring Network and SQA courses.

The Peer to Peer networks have established strong cross-network links, and will continue to meet and develop activities, either within or beyond their network. Scottish Prison Artists Network has secured funding for staff and is now a constituted, charitable company. PATER has a new website, and will continue to develop its role at national level.

The new Thematic Network for Culture, supported by the Scottish Mentoring network is a valuable AWS legacy that is fully embedded within SMN activity, and the Academic Network, managed jointly by the Royal Conservatoire and Glasgow School of Art will continue throughout 2014. It is recommended that support for this activity continues beyond AWS phase 1.

AWS has developed a rich online resource of research reports, films of keynote speakers and good practice case studies, podcasts of interviews with leading practitioners and quality factor infographics on the Creative Scotland website that leave a significant legacy, and can continue to be shared across the project and beyond as it enters the next phase.

10. Other Learning

AWS, as a jointly funded project between PHF and CS, occupied a position both within and outwith the CS structure. This semi-autonomous, semi-corporate identity created both strengths and weaknesses for the project.

The project is the only one of the 5 UK pathfinders to be led by a national funding body, creating a position of strength in terms of influencing working practices and embedding learning. The Project Lead was a permanent member of CS staff, and the project sat within the CS plan. This meant that AWS was able to utilise some of the systems and processes as resources, such as finance and communications. It also meant that AWS could maximise opportunities to connect with and enhance activity running through funded programmes.

The project was managed by a freelance Project Manager based outwith the CS offices. Because of this AWS was able to develop an identity of being partially 'in the sector', rather than simply a funder, enabling greater connectivity with artists and a more collaborative approach, both of which factors were key strengths for the project.

This structure also brought challenges, in particular around online presence for AWS; for example, whether web presence should be retained on the CS site or developed externally, and whether or not AWS could have an autonomous identity on social media.

This partially internal, partially external-to-CS structure also created challenges for services such as IT. Externally contracted staff were not well served by the remote email function, creating less streamlined communications than were desirable.

A consultant was engaged to work with the 6 HE/FE pilots to develop web content for the AWS pages on the CS website. Working across the projects and establishing a relationship with each created some valuable reflections into the AWS approach, including:

'These pilots were about experienced practitioners testing out their ideas for extending their teaching and developing methods for teaching participatory arts practice. This involved reaching beyond their institutions to introduce their students to experiences which cannot be offered solely within the confines of their own departments, colleges or universities. These new networks presented challenges. There were differences in term times, administrative procedures, aims and objectives and in approaches to teaching and learning. However, it was in negotiating around and through these challenges that the projects broke new ground and paved the way for future collaboration.'

AWS worked hard to establish trust with pilot project leads, recognising that these key individuals were not only highly experienced, but passionate enough about arts in participatory settings that they were willing to commit time and energy over and above their existing demanding jobs, to make changes in their institution.

Support for bespoke projects created opportunities for all stakeholders to realise ambitions and gain a sense of personal and professional development from the projects. Project leads commented that this level of freedom created a more mature and trusting relationship with AWS than the traditional funder/funding recipient model.

11. Recommendations:

1. Continue to support the development of the community of practice with further annual conferences, online and face-to-face events
2. Develop social media presence, keeping in mind the value of cross artform exchange, reflective practice and networking, though Twitter events and development of ArtWorksConnect plans
3. Continue to work across CS, embedding learning and sharing practice, including inputting to staff training and guidance and working across the Creative Learning team
4. Review and continue to support the national academic network
5. Continue to work with the Scottish Mentoring Network to hold events and facilitate the thematic network for culture
6. Develop guidance for CS around CPD for work in participatory settings and/or create links to guidance developed by other UK ArtWorks partners in order to encourage organisations to embed high quality CPD for artists into project plans
7. Continue to distribute existing quality factors research through infographics available as leaflets or online
8. Develop quality research into quality guidance for CS with input from the sector, including period for testing
9. Review the '*Quality Guidance Resource for Artists and Learning Providers*' report with a view to actioning recommendations.
10. Taking on board the principle of incremental 'small wins' across large networks, find ways to continue to work with pilot project partners to support further dissemination of their learning
11. Recognise the challenges to the continued development of confidence and professionalism that the lack of time and resources across the sector bring, and commit to continued provision of leadership and resources to build on impacts to date.
12. Continue to work effectively across the UK with legacy activity from all pathfinders.

12. Appendices

Appendix 1: Budget

ArtWorks Scotland summary budget 2011-14

ArtWorks Scotland income 2011-14	4 year total
Paul Hamlyn Foundation	£300,000
Creative Scotland cash	£300,000
<i>Estimate in-kind support (CS)</i>	<i>£66,840</i>
TOTAL	£666,840

ArtWorks Scotland expenditure 2011 -14	4 year total
Project staff: project management, events management, research	£173,671.76
CS in-kind support	£73,440
Research (commissioned)	£50,027
Events and networking: conferences, seminars	£91,920.25
Online: films, case studies, podcasts, social media	£30,991.95
Pilot projects: HE/FE, placements, mentoring	£121,655.4
Artists peer to peer learning networks	£64,530
Academic network	£5,000
Developing resources: artist/ teacher, placements, infographics	£17,047
Evaluation	£11,690
Artist and staff expenses, contingency, catering	£33,409.96
TOTAL	£673,383.32

Appendix 2: Quantitative/Summary Tables

ALL AWS Activities - summary	
Higher Education/Further Education	672
Mentoring	39
Creative Learning Network (CLN)	642
Peer to Peer Networks	101
Events	278
Conferences	354
TOTAL Active Participants/Attendees	2086

ArtWorks Social Media engagement	
PPNs	575
LinkedIn	329
Twitter	351
Mailing list	719

Mentoring Pilots	Number of mentors/mentees
Dancehouse	8
GMAC (Glasgow Media Access Centre)	9
SEE (Screen Education Edinburgh)	10
TMF (Traditional Music Forum)	8
Luminate	4
Total	39

HE/FE pilots

HE/FE Pilot	Title	Activity	No of participants
Glasgow School of Art Dept. of Sculpture and Environmental Art/New College Lanarkshire (GSA/NCL)	Creative Placements	14 undergrad placements in 7 Scottish Prisons	14 students, 7 learning centre managers
Gray's School of Art	Participatory Art Exchange	New course content and placements in Aberdeen and Aberdeenshire	26 students
Edinburgh College	Arts in Participatory Settings: their role in Further Education	Awareness raising for staff at CPD day	480 HE/FE staff
Moray House/Edinburgh College of Art	Adopt an Artist	Students collaborate to develop new creative approaches to initial teacher training with placements in schools	17 students, 8 HE staff, 12 teachers
Shetland College/University of Highlands and Islands	Networked Learning for Participatory Practices in the Visual Arts	New Module in Art and Social Practice using virtual learning environments	70 students, 15 FE and HE staff
Royal Conservatoire of Scotland: Pilot 1	Bursaries for 'The Teaching Artist' credit rated short course	bursaries to enable Scottish based artists to take part, test and evaluate this new course	9 students
Royal Conservatoire of Scotland: Pilot 2	A student guide to student placements; website	online resource to articulate good placements practice from a 'students-eye' view	10 artists 4 HE staff
Total			672

Creative Learning Network Knowledge Exchange	Pilot	No. taking part
Aberdeen: CreativiTea Room	Drop in facility for artists and teachers knowledge exchange during arts cross learning festival	311
Inverclyde: Creative Playtime: Outside-Insight	Artists working with staff across education, CLD, SEBN and Educational Psychology	150
Angus	mentored course for graduates wishing to develop skills to work in learning settings, involving early years practitioners, ASN and EDS staff, and 20+ primary teachers	61
Edinburgh Council	Action Learning	95 (estimated)
Forth Valley	CPD sessions to support artists and learning providers to develop good creative learning practice in the classroom	25
Total		642

PPNs

Peer to Peer Network	Core members at start of AWS	All members at end of AWS	Social Media members
TRIGGER	6	33	111
Scottish Prison Artists Network (SPAN)	8	7	111
Patter network	2	20	126
North East Participatory Arts Network	9	4	227
Edinburgh Youth Music Forum	27	37	n/a
TOTALS	52	101	575

All Pilot projects

HE/FE Pilot Projects	Mentoring Pilots	Creative Learning Network Knowledge Exchange Pilots
Glasgow School of Art Dept. of Sculpture and Environmental Art/New College Lanarkshire (GSA/NCL)	Dancehouse	Aberdeen City Council
Gray's School of Art	GMAC (Glasgow Media Access Centre)	Inverclyde Council
Edinburgh College	SEE (Screen Education Edinburgh)	Angus Council
Moray House/Edinburgh College of Art	TMF (Traditional Music Forum)	City of Edinburgh Council
Shetland College/University of Highlands and Islands	Luminate	Forth Valley Council
Royal Conservatoire of Scotland (RCS) : 2 Pilots		
672 participants	39 participants	642 participants

Appendix 3: Organisations attending Scottish Mentoring Network

Angus Council Education/Arts Team	Pledge Music
Creative Arts Business Network	Project Ability
Creative Edinburgh	Promoting YT
Creative Scotland	Puppet Animation Scotland
Cultural Enterprise Office	Riverside Music Project
Dancehouse ArtWorks Scotland mentoring pilot	Royal Conservatoire of Scotland
Dumfries & Galloway Council	Royal Lyceum Theatre Company
Dundee Contemporary Arts	Scottish Contemporary Art Network
Edinburgh Sculpture Workshop	Scottish National Portrait Gallery
Emergents Creatives Community Interest Company	Scottish Prison Arts Network (SPAN)
Falkirk Community Trust	Scottish Screen Archive (NLS)
Federation of Scottish Theatre	Scottish Youth Dance
Fèis Rois Ltd	Scottish Youth Theatre
Fife Contemporary Art & Craft	Screen Education Edinburgh
Fife Cultural Trust	Scrumptious Productions
Glasgow Life	Seeds of thought
Glasgow Mentoring Network	SMN
Glasgow Women's Libraries	STARTER FOR 6
GMAC Film	Stellar Quines
Impact Arts	Talbot Rice Gallery
Independent Artistw	The Braveheart Association
Live Music Now Scotland	The Village Story Telling Centre
Media Education	Tinderbox Project
National Galleries of Scotland	Toonspeak Young People's Theatre
National Theatre of Scotland	Traditional Music Forum
Oi Musica	University of Strathclyde
PACE	Young Scot

Appendix 4: List of events and conferences

Event	Title	Date	Attendees
Graham Leicester	From Best Practice to Next Practice	23 April 2012	49
Eric Booth Masterclass	Activated Environment; Receptive participant'	9 June 2012	30
Tim Rollins and K.O.S	Seminar for Artists and Educators in partnership with Talbot Rice Gallery	1 Aug 2012	47
National Theatre of Scotland/Citizens Theatre	Future Possible Theatre	3 Oct 2012	12
Luminate Festival for Creative Aging event	Dementia Friendly Arts	30 Oct 2012	30
AWS event for HE/FE	Sharing Learning and consultation on Pilots	13 March 2013	15
AWS event for HE/FE	Placements in Practice'	25 June 2013	24
AWS/Scottish Mentoring Network	Thematic Network for Culture	3 June 2013	26
AWS/Scottish Mentoring Network	Thematic Network for Culture	23 Oct 2013	45
Total			278

Conferences

Year	Venue	Total Attendees	Number of days
2011	Macrobert, Stirling	98	1 day
2012	Lighthouse, Glasgow	102	2 days
2013	West Park, Dundee	154	2 days
Total		354	